



Northern States Power Company

Monticello Nuclear Generating Plant
2807 West Hwy 75
Monticello, Minnesota 55362-9637

October 31, 1994

Report Required by
10 CFR Part 50, Section 50.73

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Attn: Document Control Desk
Washington, DC 20555

MONTICELLO NUCLEAR GENERATING PLANT
Docket No. 50-263 License No. DPR-22

LER 94-012

Fire Door Latch Found with Insufficient Throw Due to Original Construction Error

The Licensee Event Report for this occurrence is attached. This report contains no new NRC commitments.

Please contact Tom Parker at (612) 295-1014 if you require further information.

William J. Anderson for RSA

Roger O Anderson
Director
Licensing and Management Issues

c: Regional Administrator - III NRC
Sr Resident Inspector, NRC
NRR Project Manager, NRC
State of Minnesota,
Attn: Kris Sanda

Attachment

080048

9411090148 941031
PDR ADDCK 05000263
S PDR

*IE22
11*

NRC FORM 366 (5-92)						U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION						APPROVED BY OMB NO. 3150-0104 EXPIRES 5/31/95																							
LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)																		ESTIMATED BURDEN PER RESPONSE TO COMPLY WITH THIS INFORMATION COLLECTION REQUEST: 50.0 HRS. FORWARD COMMENTS REGARDING BURDEN ESTIMATE TO THE INFORMATION AND RECORDS MANAGEMENT BRANCH (MNBB 7714), U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION, WASHINGTON, DC 20555-0001, AND TO THE PAPERWORK REDUCTION PROJECT (3150-0104), OFFICE OF MANAGEMENT AND BUDGET, WASHINGTON, DC 20503.																	
FACILITY NAME (1) MONTICELLO NUCLEAR GENERATING PLANT												DOCKET NUMBER (2) 05000 - 263						PAGE (3) 1 OF 3																	
TITLE (4) Fire Door Latch Found with Insufficient Throw Due to Original Construction Error																																			
EVENT DATE (5)			LER NUMBER (6)				REPORT NUMBER (7)			OTHER FACILITIES INVOLVED (8)																									
MONTH	DAY	YEAR	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REVISION NUMBER	MONTH	DAY	YEAR	FACILITY NAME						DOCKET NUMBER																				
09	30	94	94	012	00	10	31	94	FACILITY NAME						DOCKET NUMBER																				
															05000																				
															05000																				
OPERATING MODE (9)		N		THIS REPORT IS SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO THE REQUIREMENTS OF 10 CFR § (Check one or more) (11)																															
				20.402(b)				20.405(c)				50.73(a)(2)(iv)				73.71(b)																			
POWER LEVEL (10)		0%		20.405(a)(1)(i)				50.36(c)(1)				50.73(a)(2)(v)				73.71(c)																			
				20.405(a)(1)(ii)				50.36(c)(2)				50.73(a)(2)(vii)				OTHER																			
				20.405(a)(1)(iii)				X 50.73(a)(2)(i)				50.73(a)(2)(viii)(A)				(Specify in Abstract below and in Text, NRC Form 365A)																			
				20.405(a)(1)(iv)				50.73(a)(2)(ii)				50.73(a)(2)(viii)(B)																							
				20.405(a)(1)(v)				50.73(a)(2)(iii)				50.73(a)(2)(x)																							
LICENSEE CONTACT FOR THIS LER (12)																																			
NAME Tom Parker										TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include Area Code) 612-295-1014																									
COMPLETE ONE LINE FOR EACH COMPONENT FAILURE DESCRIBED IN THIS REPORT (13)																																			
CAUSE	SYSTEM	COMPONENT	MANUFACTURER	REPORTABLE TO NRC					CAUSE	SYSTEM	COMPONENT	MANUFACTURER	REPORTABLE TO NRC																						
SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT EXPECTED (14)														EXPECTED SUBMISSION DATE (15)		MONTH	DAY	YEAR																	
YES (IF YES, COMPLETE EXPECTED SUBMISSION DATE)										X NO				DATE																					

ABSTRACT LIMIT TO 1400 SPACES, I.E. APPROXIMATELY 15 SINGLE-SPACED TYPEWRITTEN LINES) (16)

During the Triennial Fire Protection Plan Inspection, the latch on a double Fire Door was discovered to not meet the requirements of National Fire Protection Association 80, Standard for Fire Doors and Fire Windows. The latch was required to have a 3/4" throw and was found to have a 5/8" throw. The wrong latch was installed during original plant construction. The latch was replaced with a latch with a 3/4" throw. All Fire Doors in fire area barriers have been inspected to ensure that the correct latches are installed.

NRC FORM 366A (5-82)		U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION		APPROVED BY OMB NO. 3150-0104 EXPIRES 5/31/95	
LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) TEXT CONTINUATION				<small>ESTIMATED BURDEN PER RESPONSE TO COMPLY WITH THIS INFORMATION COLLECTION REQUEST: 50.0 HRS. FORWARD COMMENTS REGARDING BURDEN ESTIMATE TO THE INFORMATION AND RECORDS MANAGEMENT BRANCH (MNBB 7714), U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION, WASHINGTON, DC 20555-0001, AND TO THE PAPERWORK REDUCTION PROJECT (3150-0104), OFFICE OF MANAGEMENT AND BUDGET, WASHINGTON, DC 20503.</small>	
FACILITY NAME (1)		DOCKET NUMBER (2)		LER NUMBER (6)	
MONTICELLO NUCLEAR GENERATING PLANT		05000 263		YEAR 94	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER 012
				REVISION NUMBER 00	PAGE (3) 2 of 3

TEXT (If more space is required, use additional copies of NRC Form 366A) (17)

Description

On September 30, 1994, with the plant in a refueling outage, it was determined that Fire Door 61 did not have the required door latch throw. This was discovered by the Triennial Fire Protection Inspection required by Appendix C of the Operational Quality Assurance Plan.

Fire Door 61 separates the 935' Reactor Building (Fire Area I, Fire Zone 2B) from the TIP Drive Room (Fire Area III, Fire Zone 2A). The Fire Hazards analysis requires that Fire Door 61 be a 1.5 hour rated fire door. In order to assure that the barrier could withstand an 1.5 hour fire, the door must meet the National Fire Protection Association 80 (NFPA 80), Standard for Fire Doors and Fire Windows. Table 2-8(b) of NFPA 80 requires hollow metal double doors (doors in pairs) to have a 3/4" latch throw (single Fire Doors are required to have a 1/2" latch throw). The latch throw on Fire Door 61 was found to be approximately 5/8."

Cause

This error was made during original plant construction. It is not possible to determine the root cause of this error, 25 years later. However, we believe the current procurement and modification processes would not allow an incorrect door latch to be installed. Corrective actions from LER 90-016 (See Previous Similar Events) have also reduced the likelihood of such a mistake being made today.

Analysis

This event is reportable per 10 CFR Part 50, Section:

50.73(a)(2)(i)(B) Any operation or condition prohibited by the plant's Technical Specifications,

Technical Specification 3.13.G.1, requires that all fire area barriers are operable when the safe shutdown equipment in that area is required to be operable. At the time this was found, the plant was shutdown, but this deficiency is believed to have existed since original plant construction.

NRC FORM 365A (5-92)		U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION		APPROVED BY OMB NO. 3150-0104 EXPIRES 5/31/95	
LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) TEXT CONTINUATION				ESTIMATED BURDEN PER RESPONSE TO COMPLY WITH THIS INFORMATION COLLECTION REQUEST: 50.0 HRS. FORWARD COMMENTS REGARDING BURDEN ESTIMATE TO THE INFORMATION AND RECORDS MANAGEMENT BRANCH (MNBB 7714), U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION, WASHINGTON, DC 20555-0001, AND TO THE PAPERWORK REDUCTION PROJECT (3150-0104), OFFICE OF MANAGEMENT AND BUDGET, WASHINGTON, DC 20503.	
FACILITY NAME (1)		DOCKET NUMBER (2)		LER NUMBER (5)	
MONTICELLO NUCLEAR GENERATING PLANT		05000 263		YEAR 94	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER 012
				REVISION NUMBER 00	PAGE (3) 3 of 3

TEXT (If more space is required, use additional copies of NRC Form 365A) (17)

There is very little safety significance to this event. The fire loading in these areas is small: 46 minutes for the TIP drive room and 13 minutes for the Reactor Building 935' level. There are fire detectors on both sides of the barrier that alarm in the control room. A trained on-site fire brigade would respond. Any fire that occurred in this area would have been promptly contained and extinguished.

Corrective Actions

1. The latch on Fire Door 61 was replaced with a latch with a 3/4" throw.
2. The plant Fire Doors were reviewed to see if any other double doors of this type existed as fire area barriers. None were found.
3. The NFPA 80 requirements for double Fire Doors in fire area barriers were reviewed to ensure that all the requirements are being met.
4. All Fire Doors in fire area barriers were inspected to ensure that all latch throws are in compliance with the requirements of NFPA 80.

Failed Component Identification

None

Previous Similar Events

LER 90-016 This LER identified a clearance problem at the bottom of Fire Door 61. One of the corrective actions changed the modification process and work control process to ensure fire doors are properly installed