



Monticello Nuclear Generating Plant
2807 W County Road 75
Monticello, MN 55362

February 26, 2015

L-MT-15-014
10 CFR 50.73

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
ATTN: Document Control Desk
Washington, DC 20555-0001

Monticello Nuclear Generating Plant
Docket 50-263
Renewed Facility Operating License No. DPR-22

LER 2014-011-00 "Two Emergency Diesels Inoperable Due to Human Error"

Enclosed is the Monticello Licensee Event Report (LER) 2014-011-00 concerning the inoperability of both Emergency Diesel Generators. This condition is reportable to the NRC in accordance with 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(v)(A-D), Event or Condition that Could Have Prevented Fulfillment of a Safety Function.

Summary of Commitments

This letter contains no new commitments and no revisions to existing commitments.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Peter A. Gardner for'.

Peter A. Gardner
Site Vice President, Monticello Nuclear Generating Plant
Northern States Power Company – Minnesota

Enclosure

cc: Regional Administrator, Region III, USNRC
Project Manager, Monticello Nuclear Generating Plant, USNRC
Resident Inspector, Monticello Nuclear Generating Plant, USNRC



LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)

(See Page 2 for required number of digits/characters for each block)

Estimated burden per response to comply with this mandatory collection request: 80 hours. Reported lessons learned are incorporated into the licensing process and fed back to industry. Send comments regarding burden estimate to the FOIA, Privacy and Information Collections Branch (T-5 F53), U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, Washington, DC 20555-0001, or by internet e-mail to Infocollects.Resource@nrc.gov, and to the Desk Officer, Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs, NEOB-10202, (3150-0104), Office of Management and Budget, Washington, DC 20503. If a means used to impose an information collection does not display a currently valid OMB control number, the NRC may not conduct or sponsor, and a person is not required to respond to, the information collection.

1. FACILITY NAME Monticello Nuclear Generating Plant	2. DOCKET NUMBER 05000-263	3. PAGE 1 OF 4
--	--------------------------------------	--------------------------

4. TITLE
Two Emergency Diesels Inoperable Due to Human Error

5. EVENT DATE			6. LER NUMBER			7. REPORT DATE			8. OTHER FACILITIES INVOLVED	
MONTH	DAY	YEAR	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV NO.	MONTH	DAY	YEAR	FACILITY NAME	DOCKET NUMBER
12	28	2014	2014	011	00	02	26	2015		05000
									FACILITY NAME	DOCKET NUMBER
										05000

9. OPERATING MODE **11. THIS REPORT IS SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO THE REQUIREMENTS OF 10 CFR §: (Check all that apply)**

1	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2201(b)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(3)(i)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(i)(C)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(vii)
	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2201(d)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(3)(ii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(viii)(A)
	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(1)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(4)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(B)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(viii)(B)
	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(i)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(1)(i)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(iii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ix)(A)
10. POWER LEVEL 93%	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(ii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(1)(ii)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(iv)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(x)
	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(iii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(2)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 73.71(a)(4)
	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(iv)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.46(a)(3)(ii)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(B)	<input type="checkbox"/> 73.71(a)(5)
	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(v)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(i)(A)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(C)	<input type="checkbox"/> OTHER
	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(vi)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(i)(B)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(D)	Specify in Abstract below or in NRC Form 366A

12. LICENSEE CONTACT FOR THIS LER

LICENSEE CONTACT Carrie Fosaaen, Licensing Engineer	TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include Area Code) 763-295-1357
--	--

13. COMPLETE ONE LINE FOR EACH COMPONENT FAILURE DESCRIBED IN THIS REPORT

CAUSE	SYSTEM	COMPONENT	MANUFACTURER	REPORTABLE TO EPIX	CAUSE	SYSTEM	COMPONENT	MANUFACTURER	REPORTABLE TO EPIX

14. SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT EXPECTED <input type="checkbox"/> YES (If yes, complete 15. EXPECTED SUBMISSION DATE) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> NO	15. EXPECTED SUBMISSION DATE	MONTH	DAY	YEAR

ABSTRACT (Limit to 1400 spaces, i.e., approximately 15 single-spaced typewritten lines)

On December 28, 2014, during performance of the surveillance test for the 12 Emergency Diesel Generator (EDG) the Non-Licensed Operator inappropriately adjusted the local 11 EDG governor setting. The correct action was to adjust 12 EDG governor setting. As a result, both EDGs were declared inoperable.

The root cause of this event is that insufficient controls were in place to prevent the operator from manipulating the wrong component when latent issues existed.

The administratively inoperable 12 EDG was declared operable and operators completed actions to return 11 EDG to operable status following procedures and system walk down. The procedure for controlling protected equipment will be enhanced and human performance tool usage expectations were upgraded regarding the operation of Technical Specification related equipment to help prevent recurrence.



**LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)
CONTINUATION SHEET**

Estimated burden per response to comply with this mandatory collection request: 80 hours. Reported lessons learned are incorporated into the licensing process and fed back to industry. Send comments regarding burden estimate to the FOIA, Privacy and Information Collections Branch (T-5 F53), U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, Washington, DC 20555-0001, or by internet e-mail to Infocollects.Resource@nrc.gov, and to the Desk Officer, Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs, NEOB-10202, (3150-0104), Office of Management and Budget, Washington, DC 20503. If a means used to impose an information collection does not display a currently valid OMB control number, the NRC may not conduct or sponsor, and a person is not required to respond to, the information collection.

1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6. LER NUMBER			3. PAGE
		YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV NO.	
Monticello Nuclear Generating Plant	05000-263	2014	- 011	- 00	2 OF 4

NARRATIVE

EVENT DESCRIPTION

On December 28, 2014, the Monticello Nuclear Generating Plant (MNGP) was in Mode 1 at approximately 93.1% rated thermal power.

At 0716 hours plant personnel initiated a planned surveillance for 12 Emergency Diesel Generator (EDG) [DG]. At 1549 hours the 12 EDG was declared inoperable (Limiting condition for operation (LCO) 3.8.1, Condition B) and unavailable due to taking the start switches [HS] to the off position in order to bar the engine over. Barring of the 12 EDG was completed at 1612 hours and the start switches returned to normal and the 12 EDG was capable of performing its safety function in accordance with the surveillance test. However, the 12 EDG remained (administratively) inoperable in preparation for making the governor [65] adjustment and synchronizing to the grid as per the subsequent steps in the surveillance test.

At 2023 hours the Non-Licensed Operator (NLO) incorrectly adjusted the 11 EDG governor setting to the idle set point locally at the diesel. The correct action by the operator should have been to locally adjust the governor setting on 12 EDG.

At 2035 hours the 12 EDG was given a start signal per procedure. Upon starting of the 12 EDG it became apparent that the 12 EDG was running at full speed rather than at the idle set point. Operators then recognized the 11 EDG governor control switch had been manipulated rather than the 12 EDG. The out-plant Operator called the control room and reported the error. Operations declared both EDGs Inoperable and entered LCO 3.8.1 required action E at 2023 hours. With 12 EDG administratively inoperable per the guidance of the surveillance test and the 11 EDG governor incorrectly manipulated to the low speed stop, both EDGs were declared inoperable. The total time both diesels were declared inoperable concurrently was 111 minutes.

From 2045 hours to 2214 hours Operations personnel performed the applicable steps of the surveillance procedure necessary to declare the 12 EDG operable. The 12 EDG droop was not adjusted and it was not paralleled to the grid. At 2214 hours, 12 EDG was declared operable and the Technical Specifications (TS) LCO 3.8.1 Condition E required action was exited due to the restoration of 12 EDG operability. Technical Specification LCO 3.8.1 Condition B remained not met because 11 EDG was still inoperable.

Site personnel continued work to resolve the incorrect manipulation of the 11 EDG governor and return it to operable status. Following restoration of governor control switch positioning and applicable portions of operations procedure, the 11 EDG was declared operable and TS LCO 3.8.1 Condition B required action was exited on December 29, 2014 at 0450 hours.

**LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)
CONTINUATION SHEET**

1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6. LER NUMBER			3. PAGE
Monticello Nuclear Generating Plant	05000-263	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV NO.	3 OF 4
		2014	- 011	- 00	

NARRATIVE

EVENT ANALYSIS

This event is being submitted in accordance with 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(v)(A-D), event or condition that could have prevented a fulfillment of a safety function.

An engineering analysis was performed which determined that the safety system was always capable of being met. The 12 EDG was always capable of reaching rated speed (58.8 Hz to 61.2 Hz) and accepting loads within 10 seconds with the exception of the time when 12 EDG was procedurally removed from service on December 28, 2014 between 1549 hours and 1612 hours to perform engine barring. During that time 11 EDG was operable and had not been adjusted. Therefore, the safety analysis assumption that at least one diesel was capable of starting and loading within 15 seconds remained met; 12 EDG was capable of performing its safety function while 11 EDG governor control switch was set to idle.

At least one EDG was always capable of performing its safety function to support equipment needed to shut down the reactor and maintain it in a safe shutdown condition, remove residual heat, control the release of radioactive material, or mitigate the consequences of an accident. As such the identified event does not constitute a Safety System Functional Failure as defined by NEI 99-02 Revision 7. However, the event is reportable in accordance with 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(v)(A-D) because both EDGs were declared inoperable at the same time.

SAFETY SIGNIFICANCE

The EDGs provide essential power to the site during a loss of offsite power event. This event challenged the emergency power supply to the site. However, a subsequent evaluation determined that although both diesels were simultaneously inoperable during this event, at least one diesel was always capable of performing its safety function.

The EDG safety function of providing standby power to 4.16kV AC System in the event of a loss or degradation of the offsite power sources to the 4.16kV AC safety related buses was maintained during the event.

CAUSE

Insufficient controls (peer check, protected/guarded equipment) were in place to prevent the operator from manipulating the wrong component when latent issues existed (phone not working, label deficiencies, procedure clarity) and human error occurred (improper self-check).

Operations standards for stopping before proceeding when faced with uncertain conditions and the risks evaluated and managed were not adequate. Communication from the 12 EDG Room telephone [TEL] was not available. As a result, the NLO went to the opposite train, 11 EDG Room, to complete the required communications to the Control Room.

**LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)
CONTINUATION SHEET**

1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6. LER NUMBER			3. PAGE
Monticello Nuclear Generating Plant	05000-263	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV NO.	4 OF 4
		2014	- 011	- 00	

NARRATIVE

CORRECTIVE ACTION

The protected equipment program procedure will be revised to require that when any technical specification equipment is declared inoperable for any reason, including planned maintenance and surveillance testing, the redundant equipment will be flagged or protected except for short periods of out of service time not extending beyond the current shift, as authorized by the Shift Manager.

Equipment manipulations and status control procedure and human performance tool procedure will be revised to require peer checking or concurrent verification be used for manipulation of all operable TS related equipment.

PREVIOUS SIMILAR EVENTS

There were no previously similar Licensee Event Reports in the past three years.

*The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineer codes for equipment are denoted by [].