November 18, 1975

DISTRIBUTION

NRC PDR
Local PDR
ORB Reading
KRGoller
TJCarter
OELD
OI&E 3
RWReid
DNBridges
RIngram
SVarga
DEisenhut
Abernathy
ACRS 16
Gray file 1
extras (5)

Docket No. 50-261

Carolina Power & Light Company
ATTN: J. A. Jones
Senior Vice President
336 Fayetteville Street
Raleigh, North Carolina 27602

Gentlemen:

We have reviewed your letter of September 17, 1975 which proposed a plant modification to H. B. Robinson Steam Electric Plant Unit 2 to enable control of certain ECCS related valves from the control room with the objective of satisfying the single failure criteria and to eliminate the present requirement for operator action.

Our review of this modified design indicates that the required single failure criteria still has not been met. With the proposed design a single event can cause failures resulting in spurious valve movement. Also a single failure can deny the operator intelligence for determining the position of the valve, particularly when it is in an unwanted position.

The preferred method for resolving the single failure problem with respect to valves is to provide all of the following:

1. A design that enables removal and restoration of valve motive power from the control room.

2. A redundant valve position indication system.

3. Physical separation and independence of circuits which assures that no single event will cause spurious valve operation.

Please advise us of your plans for modifying your system. You may find the above method acceptable or may propose and support an alternative method.

/S/

Robert W. Reid, Chief
Operating Reactors Branch 4
Division of Reactor Licensing

ECCS

cc: See next page

See Previous Concurrences

| OFFICE | ORB 4 | ORB 4 | EICSB | AD/RL:OR'S | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| SURNAME | DBridges/BK | RWReid | Ippolito | GOLLER KRG | | |
| DATE | 11/18/75 | 11/18/75 | 11/ /75 | 11/18/175 | | |

Form AEC-318 (Rev. 9-53) AECM 0240 ☆ U. S. GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE: 1974-526-166

Distribution

NRC PDR
Local PDR
Docket
ORB Reading
KRGoller
TJCarter
OELD
OI&E (3)
Branch Chief RWReid
DNBridges
RIngram
SVarga
Deisenhut
TBAbernathy, DTIE
ACRS (16)
Gray file
Extra copy (5)

Docket No. 50-261

Carolina Power & Light Company
ATTN: J. A. Jones
Senior Vice President
336 Fayetteville Street
Raleigh, North Carolina 27602

Gentlemen:

We have reviewed your letter of September 17, 1975 which proposes a plant modification to H. B. Robinson Steam Electric Plant Unit 2 to enable control of certain ECCS related valves from the control room with the objective of satisfying the single failure criteria and to eliminate the present requirement for operator action.

Our review of this modified design indicates that the required single failure criteria still has not been met. With the proposed design a single event can cause failures resulting in spurious valve movement. Also a single failure can deny the operator intelligence for determining the position of the valve, particularly when it is in an unwanted position.

The preferred method for implementing single failure considerations are:

1. Provide a design for removing and restoring valve motive power from the control room.

2. Provide a redundant valve position indication system.

3. Provide physical separation and independence of circuits which assures that no single event will cause spurious valve operation.

Please advise us of your plans for modifying your system in light of the review and comments.

Robert W. Reid, Chief
Operating Reactors Branch #4
Division of Reactor Licensing

| OFFICE ➤ | cc: ORB #4 See next page | ORB#4 | EICSB | AD/RL:OR"s | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| SURNAME ➤ | DNBridges/mt | RWReid | Ippolito | Goller | | |
| DATE ➤ | 11/11/75 | 11/12/75 | 11/13/75 | 11/ /75 | | |

Form AEC-318 (Rev. 9-53) AECM 0240 ☆ U. S. GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE: 1974-526-166

Local PDR

UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D. C. 20555

November 18, 1975

Docket No. 50-261

Carolina Power & Light Company
ATTN: J. A. Jones
Senior Vice President
336 Fayetteville Street
Raleigh, North Carolina 27602

Gentlemen:

We have reviewed your letter of September 17, 1975 which proposes a plant modification to H. B. Robinson Steam Electric Plant Unit 2 to enable control of certain ECCS related valves from the control room with the objective of satisfying the single failure criteria and to eliminate the present requirement for operator action.

Our review of this modified design indicates that the required single failure criteria still has not been met. With the proposed design a single event can cause failures resulting in spurious valve movement. Also a single failure can deny the operator intelligence for determining the position of the valve, particularly when it is in an unwanted position.

The preferred method for resolving the single failure problem with respect to valves is to provide all of the following:

1. A design that enables removal and restoration of valve motive power from the control room.

2. A redundant valve position indication system.

3. Physical separation and independence of circuits which assures that no single event will cause spurious valve operation.

Please advise us of your plans for modifying your system. You may find the above method acceptable or may propose and support an alternative method.

Robert W. Reid, Chief
Operating Reactors Branch 4
Division of Reactor Licensing

cc: See next page

cc:

G. F. Trowbridge, Esquire
Shaw, Pittman, Potts, Trowbridge & Madden
Barr Building
910 17th Street, N. W.
Washington, D. C. 20006

Hartsville Memorial Library
Home and Fifth Avenue
Hartsville, South Carolina 29550

NRC PDR

UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D. C. 20555

November 18, 1975

Docket No. 50-261

Carolina Power & Light Company
ATTN: J. A. Jones
Senior Vice President
336 Fayetteville Street
Raleigh, North Carolina 27602

Gentlemen:

We have reviewed your letter of September 17, 1975 which proposes a plant modification to H. B. Robinson Steam Electric Plant Unit 2 to enable control of certain ECCS related valves from the control room with the objective of satisfying the single failure criteria and to eliminate the present requirement for operator action.

Our review of this modified design indicates that the required single failure criteria still has not been met. With the proposed design a single event can cause failures resulting in spurious valve movement. Also a single failure can deny the operator intelligence for determining the position of the valve, particularly when it is in an unwanted position.

The preferred method for resolving the single failure problem with respect to valves is to provide all of the following:

1. A design that enables removal and restoration of valve motive power from the control room.

2. A redundant valve position indication system.

3. Physical separation and independence of circuits which assures that no single event will cause spurious valve operation.

Please advise us of your plans for modifying your system. You may find the above method acceptable or may propose and support an alternative method.

for

Robert W. Reid, Chief
Operating Reactors Branch 4
Division of Reactor Licensing

cc: See next page

cc:

G. F. Trowbridge, Esquire
Shaw, Pittman, Potts, Trowbridge & Madden
Barr Building
910 17th Street, N. W.
Washington, D. C. 20006

Hartsville Memorial Library
Home and Fifth Avenue
Hartsville, South Carolina 29550