

Hardies, Robert

From: Stevens, Gary *RG*
Sent: Monday, December 17, 2012 11:20 AM
To: Hardies, Robert; Fairbanks, Carolyn; Poehler, Jeffrey; Nove, Carol; Kirk, Mark; Csontos, Aladar; Rosenberg, Stacey
Subject: FW: Doel 3 -Tihange 2 RPV issue - WG3 - justification file
Attachments: GLS Review Comments on Doel3-Tihange 2 Documents.xlsx

FYI, I'm sending the below tomorrow a.m., so if you have any comments, please provide by COB today. Thx,
Gary

Guy:

In response to your e-mail request below dated November 30th, please find my responses as follows. Please note that the following input reflects my personal technical opinion, and it does not reflect an official NRC agency position. Also, please note that my focus of attention was on the Structural Integrity Assessments (SIAs), and not on the other portions of the investigations (i.e., NDE or metallurgy).

(b)(4),(b)(7)(D)

E/42

I would like to express my sincere thanks to you personally, as well as to both Bel V and FANC, for requesting me to participate in this review. Please let me know if there is anything else you require from me on this topic. Regardless of your needs, I hope a continued correspondence with you will be possible on other mutual topics of interest.

My best wishes to Bel V and FANC on their finalized decision for Doel 3 and Tihange 2, and my best wishes to you and all of your colleagues and families for the Holiday Season.

Best Regards,

Gary L. Stevens

Senior Materials Engineer

NRC/RES/DE/CIB

E-mail: Gary.Stevens@nrc.gov

Office: 301-251-7569

Blackberry:

(b)(6)

From: Roussel Guy [<mailto:guy.roussel@Belv.be>]

Sent: Friday, November 30, 2012 1:34 AM

To: aweyn@vincotte.be; Bjorn.Brickstad@ssm.se; bsf@csn.es; car@csn.es; francois.balestreri@irsn.fr; fvanherck@vincotte.be; Stevens, Gary; igor.simonovski@ec.europa.eu; John.Highton@hse.gsi.gov.uk; Juergen.Sievers@grs.de; Kamreddine.OULIDDREN@FANC.FGOV.BE; Kjellin, Daniel; Klaus.Germerdonk@ensi.ch; laurent.streibig@asn.fr; Lutz.lindhorst@ilent.nl; Nancy.SALGADO@oecd.org; Hardies, Robert; Roussel Guy; sangmin.lee@kins.re.kr; ??? ??

Cc: WERTELAERS An; VAN WONTERGHEM Frederik; Deprez Marc; Briegleb Pierre; Barras Pierre; Marloye Daniel; Deledicque Vincent; Beatrice.TOMBUYES@FANC.FGOV.BE; Roussel Guy

Subject: Doel 3 -Tihange 2 RPV issue - WG3 - justification file

Dear WG3 member,

The safety case ('justification file') for the Doel 3-Tihange 2 RPV issue should be released by the Licensee on 30 November and posted to the FANC portal shortly after.

Some other documents related to the methodology used for demonstrating the structural integrity and to other specific input data (e.g., transients) had previously been posted to the FANC portal. I am not aware whether other reports documenting the structural integrity demonstration will be made available before end of November.

The reports released by the Licensee before December 1 are considered by Bel V and AIB-Vinçotte as the basis documentation on which the preliminary conclusions of their assessment of the demonstration of the RPV structural integrity will be based.

We would appreciate if you could spend some time by reviewing the documents posted to the FANC portal. In particular, your opinions on the following questions will be of great value to us:

- (1) Do you consider the justification file as comprehensive and complete ?
- (2) Do you consider the justification procedure as an appropriate procedure for the type and extent of the detected degradation ? Justify our answer
- (3) If answer to question (2) is no: are there any changes that you would require to make the procedure appropriate ?
- (4) If answer to question (2) is yes: are there on some matters weaknesses for which you would require improvements ?

- (5) Did you find in the documents you have reviewed any inconsistency or lack of justification ?
(6) Have you any other specific remarks ?

You ask you to provide your answers at your earliest convenience but, if possible, before December 12.

On the basis of your answers, we will decide whether a meeting in Brussels (possibly with representatives of the Licensee) is necessary within a short delay.

We thank you for your efforts.

Best regards,

Guy Roussel
Chairman of WG 3

Be V
rue Walcourt 148
B-1070 Bruxelles
Belgium
www.belv.be

+32 2 52 80 357
e-mail: guy.roussel@belv.be

(b)(4),(b)(7)(D)

(b)(4),(b)(7)(D)

(b)(4),(b)(7)(D)

(b)(4),(b)(7)(D)