

Mitman, Jeffrey

From: Laur, Steven *INR*
Sent: Thursday, March 04, 2010 10:36 AM
To: Mitman, Jeffrey; Vail, James
Cc: James, Lois; Ferrante, Fernando
Subject: RE: DRA/APOB's documentation of the generic dam failure frequency
Attachments: check bayesian update.xls; APOB Jocassee Dam - sal comments.doc

Jeff, Jim and Fernando:

I have completed a peer-review of the document you provided. I believe the results are in the correct ball-park, but there are some portions of the report where I cannot reproduce your numbers. For example, it is not clear how you derived the prior distribution in the Bayes analysis, and your posterior distribution appears different than NUREG/CR-6823 (your reference) would suggest (get about half of your frequency).

I have also provided some content and editorial suggestions.

Attached is a "Track Changes" version of your report with my comments. I also included the spreadsheet I used to check your Bayesian update, which arrives at slightly different numbers.

Please let me know when you'd like to meet and discuss my comments (especially the technical ones).

Steven A. Laur
NRR Division of Risk Assessment
QWFN 10-C15
(301) 415-2889
steven.laur@nrc.gov

From: Mitman, Jeffrey *INR*
Sent: Wednesday, March 03, 2010 10:41 AM
To: Vail, James; Laur, Steven
Cc: James, Lois; Ferrante, Fernando
Subject: DRA/APOB's documentation of the generic dam failure frequency
Importance: High

Jim and Steve, attached is a revised and final version of the subject document. I owe this document to the DRA FO by next week. As your names are on this document as analyst and peer reviewer respectively, your concurrence on this version is requested. If I could get your concurrence by the end of this week it would be greatly appreciated. The changes between this version and the versions that you previously concurred on is a matter of format, stile and detail. The methodology and data used and the results have not been altered.

Jeff

From: Ferrante, Fernando *INR*
Sent: Wednesday, March 03, 2010 10:29 AM
To: Mitman, Jeffrey
Subject: RE: ACTION: provide BC with latest version of DRA/APOB's documentation of the generic dam failure frequency by COB 2/19/10

Here it is.

From: Mitman, Jeffrey
Sent: Monday, March 01, 2010 6:08 PM
To: James, Lois
Cc: Ferrante, Fernando
Subject: RE: ACTION: provide BC with latest version of DRA/APOB's documentation of the generic dam failure frequency by COB 2/19/10
Importance: High

Lois, by the below listed email I transmitted to you the DRA/APOB risk analysis as requested. Subsequent to this email, Fernando has made editorial changes to the document, see the email from Fernando containing this version of the analysis. Having not received comments from you, I'm not sure how to proceed. Your direction is requested.

Jeff

From: Mitman, Jeffrey
Sent: Friday, February 19, 2010 6:05 PM
To: James, Lois
Cc: Ferrante, Fernando
Subject: RE: ACTION: provide BC with latest version of DRA/APOB's documentation of the generic dam failure frequency by COB 2/19/10


Lois, attached is the latest version of the requested analysis. Fernando and I have worked on in to incorporate the concerns regarding peer review (re ADM-504) and suggestions and issues raised by DE and others. I know of no additional changes which are required.

Fernando, I've made only very minor punctuation changes and formatting changes to your most recent version and I've accepted all Word revision mark changes.

To remove the "draft" designation it should be reviewed by Jim Vail as a co-author and the independent review needs to be performed (reperformed). I assume this would be by Steve.

Once this is completed we can formally transmit it again to the front office and put it in Adams as an official agency record.

Jeff

From: James, Lois 
Sent: Friday, February 19, 2010 10:55 AM
To: Mitman, Jeffrey
Subject: ACTION: provide BC with latest version of DRA/APOB's documentation of the generic dam failure frequency by COB 2/19/10

Jeff,

Since you will be out next week and we need to continue work on the dam failure frequency, please email me the latest version of the document in word format. I believe you were making revisions based on reviewing LIC-504.

Lois