



**UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION**
REGION II
245 PEACHTREE CENTER AVENUE NE, SUITE 1200
ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-1257

July 31, 2012

Tom A. Lynch
Vice President - Farley
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
7388 North State Highway 95
Columbia, AL 36319

SUBJECT: NOTICE OF ENFORCEMENT DISCRETION DENIAL FOR SOUTHERN
NUCLEAR COMPANY REGARDING JOSEPH M. FARLEY NUCLEAR PLANT,
V23414 - NOED (NOTICE OF ENFORCEMENT DISCRETION) FARLEY UNIT 1,
NOED NO. 12-2-002

Dear Mr. Lynch:

By letter dated July 30, 2012, you requested that the NRC exercise discretion to not enforce compliance with the actions required in the Joseph M. Farley Nuclear Plant (FNP) Technical Specification 3.8.1.B, A/C Sources – Operating, One Diesel Generator (DG) Set Inoperable. Your letter documented information previously discussed with the NRC in a telephone conference on July 26, 2012, at 6:00 p.m. The principal NRC staff members who participated in that telephone conference included Len Wert, Deputy Regional Administrator for Operations, Region II and Eugene Guthrie, Acting Director for Division of Reactor Projects. You stated that on July 26, 2012, at 9:52 p.m. the plant would not be in compliance with Technical Specification 3.8.1.B which would require you to place the plant in Mode 3 (hot standby, with the reactor shutdown) by July 27 at 3:52 a.m. You requested that a Notice of Enforcement Discretion (NOED) be granted pursuant to the NRC's policy regarding exercise of discretion for an operating facility, set out in Section VII.C, of the "General Statement of Policy and Procedures for NRC Enforcement Actions" (Enforcement Policy), NUREG-1600, and be effective for the shorter of either the time to return the 1B DG to service or the 66-hour extension from 9:52 p.m., July 26, 2012. This letter documents our telephone conversation starting July 26 at 6:00 P.M., when we orally declined to issue this NOED.

You described the events leading up to the request for the NOED as follows: On July 16, 2012, at 9:52 p.m., you entered Technical Specification 3.8.1.B, with a 10 day allowable outage time (AOT), to conduct 24-month maintenance activities on the 1B DG set. Five days into the AOT, after completing several maintenance activities, you ran the 1B DG as part of the maintenance work order. The 1B the DG inner condenser cooling water control valve malfunctioned during this run, which resulted in overheating and damage to the 1B DG. You recognized that the time to complete the repairs and perform necessary inspections and subsequent test runs could require up to 66 hours more than the time remaining in the AOT.

In evaluating your NOED request, the NRC staff could not conclude that you satisfactorily addressed item number eight in Section D of NRC Inspection Manual, Part 9900: Technical Guidance, Operations – Notices of Enforcement Discretion. Specifically, Branch Technical Position (BTP) 8-8 of the Standard Review Plan, Onsite (Emergency Diesel Generators) and Offsite Power Sources Allowed Outage Time, Extension, Page 8-8-4, 4th paragraph, was discussed. This BTP specifies, in part, that multi-unit sites that have installed a single alternate AC (AAC) power source for station blackout (SBO) cannot substitute it for the inoperable DG when requesting AOT extensions unless the AAC source has enough capacity to carry all loss of offsite power (LOOP) loads to bring the unit to a cold shutdown as a substitute for the DG in an extended AOT and carry all SBO loads for the unit that has an SBO event without any load shedding. The NRC concluded that relying on a single AAC power source for an SBO in one unit and an inoperable DG in the adjacent unit erodes the defense-in-depth aspects of the plant's design and operation and thereby reduces the safety margins due to a planned extended allowed outage time and that the request was not acceptable.

You made no commitments with regard to a follow-up amendment and the nature of the request.

On the basis of the staff's evaluation of your request, we have concluded that granting this NOED is inconsistent with the Enforcement Policy and staff guidance, and may have an adverse impact on public health and safety or the environment, if granted. Therefore, your request was denied and FNP subsequently complied with the required actions of Technical Specification 3.8.1.B.

Sincerely,

/RA/

Leonard D. Wert, Jr.
Deputy Regional Administrator
Region II

Docket No.: 50-348
License No: NPF-2

cc: (See page 3)

In evaluating your NOED request, the NRC staff could not conclude that you satisfactorily addressed item number eight in Section D of NRC Inspection Manual, Part 9900: Technical Guidance, Operations – Notices of Enforcement Discretion. Specifically, Branch Technical Position (BTP) 8-8 of the Standard Review Plan, Onsite (Emergency Diesel Generators) and Offsite Power Sources Allowed Outage Time, Extension, Page 8-8-4, 4th paragraph, was discussed. This BTP specifies, in part, that multi-unit sites that have installed a single alternate AC (AAC) power source for station blackout (SBO) cannot substitute it for the inoperable DG when requesting AOT extensions unless the AAC source has enough capacity to carry all loss of offsite power (LOOP) loads to bring the unit to a cold shutdown as a substitute for the DG in an extended AOT and carry all SBO loads for the unit that has an SBO event without any load shedding. The NRC concluded that relying on a single AAC power source for an SBO in one unit and an inoperable DG in the adjacent unit erodes the defense-in-depth aspects of the plant's design and operation and thereby reduces the safety margins due to a planned extended allowed outage time and that the request was not acceptable.

You made no commitments with regard to a follow-up amendment and the nature of the request.

On the basis of the staff's evaluation of your request, we have concluded that granting this NOED is inconsistent with the Enforcement Policy and staff guidance, and may have an adverse impact on public health and safety or the environment, if granted. Therefore, your request was denied and FNP subsequently complied with the required actions of Technical Specification 3.8.1.B.

Sincerely,

/RA/

Leonard D. Wert, Jr.
Deputy Regional Administrator
Region II

Docket No.: 50-348

License No: NPF-2

cc: (See page 3)

X PUBLICLY AVAILABLE

☐ NON-PUBLICLY AVAILABLE

☐ SENSITIVE

X NON-SENSITIVE

ADAMS: ☐ Yes

ACCESSION NUMBER: _____

☐ SUNSI REVIEW COMPLETE ☐ FORM 665 ATTACHED

OFFICE	RII:DRP	RII:DRP	RII:DRP	RII:DRP			
SIGNATURE	MOM /RA/	FJH /RA/	RPC /RA/	LDW /RA/			
NAME	MMiller	FEhrhardt	RCroteau	LWert			
DATE	7/ /2012	7/ /2012	7/ /2012	7/ /2012	7/ /2012	7/ /2012	7/ /2012
E-MAIL COPY?	YES NO	YES NO	YES NO	YES NO	YES NO	YES NO	YES NO

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY DOCUMENT NAME: G:\DRPI\RPB2\FARLEY\NOEDS\NOED 12-2-02 1B EDG AOT
EXTENSION\LETTER FOR DENYING A NOED.DOCX

cc w/encl:
C. Russ Dedrickson
Fleet Support Supervisor
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

Cheryl A. Gayheart
Plant Manager
Joseph M. Farley Nuclear Plant
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

S. Kuczynski
Chairman, President and CEO
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

J. L. Pemberton
SVP & General Counsel-Ops & SNC
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

D. G. Bost
Chief Nuclear Officer
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

Dennis R. Madison
Vice President
Edwin I. Hatch Nuclear Plant
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

Paula Marino
Vice President
Engineering
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

T. E. Tynan
Site Vice President
Vogtle Electric Generating Plant
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

M. J. Ajluni
Nuclear Licensing Director
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

Mark Williams
Commissioner
Georgia Department of Natural Resources
Electronic Mail Distribution

B. D. McKinney, Jr.
Regulatory Response Manager
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

D. W. Daughhetee
Licensing Engineer
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

T. D. Honeycutt
Regulatory Response Supervisor
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

L. Mike Stinson
Vice President
Fleet Operations Support
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

N. J. Stringfellow
Licensing Manager
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

L. P. Hill
Licensing Supervisor
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

L. L. Crumpton
Administrative Assistant, Sr.
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

William D. Oldfield
Principal Licensing Engineer
Joseph M. Farley Nuclear Plant
Electronic Mail Distribution

(cc w/encl continued next page)

T. Lynch

4

(cc w/encl continued)

Todd L. Youngblood
Vice President
Fleet Oversight
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

John G. Horn
Site Support Manager
Joseph M. Farley Nuclear Plant
Southern Nuclear Operating Company, Inc.
Electronic Mail Distribution

Cynthia A. Sanders
Radioactive Materials Program Manager
Environmental Protection Division
Georgia Department of Natural Resources
Electronic Mail Distribution

James C. Hardeman
Environmental Radiation Program Manager
Environmental Protection Division
Georgia Department of Natural Resources
Electronic Mail Distribution

Mr. Mark Culver
Chairman
Houston County Commission
P. O. Box 6406
Dothan, AL 36302

James L. McNees, CHP
Director
Office of Radiation Control
Alabama Dept. of Public Health
P. O. Box 303017
Montgomery, AL 36130-3017

Donald E. Williamson
State Health Officer
Alabama Dept. of Public Health
RSA Tower - Administration
Suite 1552
P.O. Box 30317
Montgomery, AL 36130-3017

Chuck Mueller
Manager
Policy and Radiation Program
Georgia Department of Natural Resources
Electronic Mail Distribution

T. Lynch

5

Letter to T. A. Lynch from Leonard D. Wert, Jr. dated July 31, 2012

SUBJECT: NOTICE OF ENFORCEMENT DISCRETION DENIAL FOR SOUTHERN
NUCLEAR COMPANY REGARDING JOSEPH M. FARLEY NUCLEAR PLANT,
V23414 - NOED (NOTICE OF ENFORCEMENT DISCRETION) FARLEY UNIT 1,
NOED NO. 12-2-002

Distribution w/encl:

C. Evans, RII

L. Douglas, RII

OE Mail

RIDSNNRRDIRS

PUBLIC

RidsNrrPMFarley Resource