

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

BEFORE THE PRE-LICENSE APPLICATION PRESIDING OFFICER BOARD

In the Matter of	)	Docket No. PAPO-00
	)	
U.S. Department of Energy	)	ASLBP No. 04-829-01-PAPO
	)	
(High Level Waste Repository:	)	
Pre-Application Matters)	)	August 9, 2008

**STATE OF NEVADA'S MOTION FOR LEAVE  
TO FILE REPLY TO RESPONSES**

The State of Nevada moves for permission to file a short Reply to the NRC Staff's, the Department of Energy's, and the Nuclear Energy Institute's Responses to the State of Nevada's Motion for a Declaratory Ruling filed on August 3, 2007. Nevada's proposed Reply is attached hereto. Nevada's Reply focuses primarily on the NRC Staff's Response and would express a qualified agreement with the NRC Staff's position and would narrow the issues in the litigation surrounding Nevada's original motion.

In accordance with 10 C.F.R. §2.323(b), counsel certifies that a sincere effort has been made to contact counsel for the other potential parties most affected, the NRC Staff, the Department of Energy, and the Nuclear Energy Institute, to see if they object to this Motion. All three have been contacted and none of the three objects to this Motion, although this does not signify their agreement with Nevada's Reply or its underlying Motion. Nevada would not object if any of these three parties filed a response to this Reply in a timely manner.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/

Martin G. Malsch

Joseph R. Egan

Charles J. Fitzpatrick

EGAN, FITZPATRICK & MALSCH, PLLC

2001 K Street NW, Suite 400

Washington, D.C. 20006

202.662 2103 Telephone

202.662 2190 Facsimile

[mmalsch@nuclearlawyer.com](mailto:mmalsch@nuclearlawyer.com)

[jegan@nuclearlawyer.com](mailto:jegan@nuclearlawyer.com)

[cfitzpatrick@nuclearlawyer.com](mailto:cfitzpatrick@nuclearlawyer.com)

Dated: August 9, 2007

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

BEFORE THE PRE-LICENSE APPLICATION PRESIDING OFFICER BOARD

In the Matter of	)	Docket No. PAPO-00
	)	
U.S. Department of Energy	)	ASLBP No. 04-829-01-PAPO
	)	
(High Level Waste Repository:	)	
Pre-Application Matters)	)	August 9, 2007

**STATE OF NEVADA'S REPLY TO THE RESPONSES  
TO NEVADA'S MOTION FOR A DECLARATORY ORDER**

The State of Nevada files this short Reply to the Responses to Nevada's Motion for a Declaratory Ruling to Define and Compel Compliance by DOE with 10 C.F.R. §2.1003(a). Nevada's Reply focuses primarily on the Response of the NRC Staff.

Nevada's Motion poses a vital and fundamental question whose resolution will determine whether the upcoming Yucca Mountain licensing proceeding, the largest such proceeding in NRC's history and arguably the most important, will be conducted in an efficient and orderly manner.

Nevada's Motion does not ask – as it has been mischaracterized – for an order requiring DOE to certify production of documents that do not exist, or to stop producing documents, or to achieve perfection or "absolute" compliance in its document listing. Instead, Nevada's Motion asks that DOE be ordered to comply reasonably with the intent of the LSN rule – to make available to other proceeding participants the documentary safety basis of its license application six months in advance; or stated otherwise, not to tender an application until six months after the DOE has complied in good faith with the LSN rule. The need for such an order now arises from DOE's clearly stated intention, both before and in its Response, to meet its projected license

application date<sup>1</sup> even if documents essential to the application and the early drafting of contentions are missing from its initial certification. This would compress the time available for other participants to react to DOE's license application, lead to incomplete licensing contentions, and cause unnecessary complexity and delay.

This issue should not await examination until after DOE files an application or even until it certifies initially its document submittal. It is crucial that the Board make clear to DOE now what LSN compliance requires so there will be no regulatory uncertainty, and DOE can, if necessary, adjust its document completion and delivery schedules.

Nevada finds that a reasonable approach, and one which would significantly narrow Nevada's prayer for relief and the scope of the litigation surrounding Nevada's Motion, is suggested in NRC Staff's Response. NRC's Response states on page 6, note 5, that the purpose of the LSN rule would be defeated if DOE were to certify a "substantially incomplete" document collection. Nevada *agrees* with Staff that the appropriate test is indeed whether the collection is substantially complete when DOE initially certifies, and this means that the initial LSN submittal must contain the basic substantive building blocks required of DOE's application.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> The Government Accountability Office's recent report on Yucca, GAO-07-1010 (August 2007), makes clear (at p. 2) that DOE did not consult with NRC, the nuclear industry, or any other stakeholders before it established its license application schedule.

<sup>2</sup> NRC Staff's formulation would of course have to be applied carefully. If obviously critical technical documents are missing, the time needed to complete an expert review of such documents will be truncated, with the possible result that the time for filing contentions directed to such documents may need to be extended. That there are millions of DOE documents on the LSN when DOE initially certifies is irrelevant. Neither Nevada nor other participants will have the resources or time to review fully each such document, and many of them will be irrelevant or in the process of revision, making a review of them a waste of time and resources. The test is not whether a "majority" of the required documents are there, but whether the documents truly necessary for licensing are there in a substantially complete set.

Nevada also agrees with NRC Staff that compliance with a substantial completeness test presents a factual issue. But it is one that should not be difficult to apply. Application of the test does not involve production of the last absolute detail, but simply *good faith* and *reasonable compliance in view of what is required for licensing*. To avoid needless delays later, the PAPO can and should decide now the nature of *minimum compliance* and hold that the purpose of the LSN rule (early document discovery to facilitate early drafting of adequate contentions) cannot be met with vitally important safety documents like the Analysis Model Reports ("AMRs") and the Total System Performance Assessment ("TSPA") missing.<sup>3</sup>

Reasonable compliance with the LSN rule means that, not only does the documentary material have to be available, but it has to be available in a form usable by other proceeding participants. Nevada's Motion points out at page 29 that DOE is planning to certify a document collection that does not include all AMRs and the critically important TSPA. The TSPA is required by 10 C.F.R. §§63.21(c)(9)-(14), 63.102(j) and 63.114. The AMRs are required by 10 C.F.R. §63.21(c)(15); and there is no question that 10 C.F.R. §2.1003(a)(2) requires submittal of, among other things, "[TSPA] computer runs, computer programs and codes," and "digital computer printouts," for which, unlike the case in 10 C.F.R. §2.1003(a)(1), there is no exception for "preliminary drafts."

These documents are at the very core of DOE's disposal safety analysis, and without each it would be impossible to begin drafting an adequate and complete, or even substantially complete, set of contentions. To avoid a train wreck later, with recriminations on all sides,

---

<sup>3</sup> Although the Yucca licensing proceeding is likely to be far more complex than most NRC proceedings, where contentions are due 60 days after publication of the notice of hearing, contentions in the Yucca proceeding are due within only 30 days after publication of the notice of hearing – half the time. NRC explained that 30 days rather than the usual 60 was appropriate "in view of the ample pre-application document disclosures provided by the LSN." 69 Fed. Reg. 2199 (Jan. 14, 2004).

Nevada respectfully requests that the PAPO instruct DOE now that an initial certification which is not, in good faith, substantially complete would defeat the purpose of the LSN rule and is not acceptable.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/

Martin G. Malsch

Joseph R. Egan

Charles J. Fitzpatrick

EGAN, FITZPATRICK & MALSCH, PLLC

2001 K Street NW, Suite 400

Washington, D.C. 20006

202.662 2103 Telephone

202.662 2190 Facsimile

[mmalsch@nuclearlawyer.com](mailto:mmalsch@nuclearlawyer.com)

[jegan@nuclearlawyer.com](mailto:jegan@nuclearlawyer.com)

[cfitzpatrick@nuclearlawyer.com](mailto:cfitzpatrick@nuclearlawyer.com)

Dated: August 9, 2007

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

In the Matter of	)	
	)	
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY	)	Docket No. PAPO-00
	)	
(High-Level Waste Repository:	)	
Pre-Application Matters)	)	

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that the foregoing State of Nevada's Motion for Leave to File Reply to Responses has been served upon the following persons either by Electronic Information Exchange or electronic mail (denoted by an asterisk (\*)).

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel  
Mail Stop - T-3 F23  
Washington, DC 20555-0001  
Thomas S. Moore, Chair  
Administrative Judge  
Email: [PAPO@nrc.gov](mailto:PAPO@nrc.gov)  
Alex S. Karlin  
Administrative Judge  
Email: [PAPO@nrc.gov](mailto:PAPO@nrc.gov)  
Alan S. Rosenthal  
Administrative Judge  
Email: [PAPO@nrc.gov & rsnthl@comcast.net](mailto:PAPO@nrc.gov & rsnthl@comcast.net)  
G. Paul Bollwerk, III  
Administrative Judge  
Email: [PAPO@nrc.gov](mailto:PAPO@nrc.gov)  
Anthony C. Eitreim, Esq.  
Chief Counsel  
Email: [PAPO@nrc.gov](mailto:PAPO@nrc.gov)  
James M. Cutchin  
Email: [PAPO@nrc.gov](mailto:PAPO@nrc.gov)  
Jered Lindsay  
Email: [PAPO@nrc.gov](mailto:PAPO@nrc.gov)  
Marcia Carpentier\*  
Email: [PAPO@nrc.gov](mailto:PAPO@nrc.gov)  
Margaret Parish  
Email: [PAPO@nrc.gov](mailto:PAPO@nrc.gov)  
Debra Wolf  
Email: [PAPO@nrc.gov](mailto:PAPO@nrc.gov)  
Bradley S. Baxter\*  
Email: [bxh@nrc.gov](mailto:bxh@nrc.gov)  
Daniel J. Graser  
LSN Administrator  
Email: [djg2@nrc.gov](mailto:djg2@nrc.gov)  
ASLBP HLW Adjudication  
Email: [ASLBP\\_HLW\\_Adjudication@nrc.gov](mailto:ASLBP_HLW_Adjudication@nrc.gov)

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Office of the Secretary of the Commission  
Mail Stop - O-16 C1  
Washington, DC 20555-0001  
Hearing Docket  
Email: [hearingdocket@nrc.gov](mailto:hearingdocket@nrc.gov)  
Andrew L. Bates  
Email: [alb@nrc.gov](mailto:alb@nrc.gov)  
Adria T. Byrdsong  
Email: [atbl@nrc.gov](mailto:atbl@nrc.gov)  
Emile L. Julian, Esq.  
Email: [elj@nrc.gov](mailto:elj@nrc.gov)  
Evangeline S. Ngbea  
Email: [esn@nrc.gov](mailto:esn@nrc.gov)  
Rebecca L. Giitter  
Email: [rll@nrc.gov](mailto:rll@nrc.gov)

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Office of Congressional Affairs  
Mail Stop O-17A3

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Office of Public Affairs  
Mail Stop O-2A13  
David McIntyre  
Email: [dtm@nrc.gov](mailto:dtm@nrc.gov)

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Office of the General Counsel  
Mail Stop - O-15 D21  
Washington, DC 20555-0001  
Karen D. Cyr, Esq.\*  
General Counsel  
Email: [kdc@nrc.gov](mailto:kdc@nrc.gov)  
Gwendolyn D. Hawkins  
Email: [gxh2@nrc.gov](mailto:gxh2@nrc.gov)  
Janice E. Moore, Esq.  
Email: [jem@nrc.gov](mailto:jem@nrc.gov)

Trip Rothschild, Esq.\*

Email: [tbr@nrc.gov](mailto:tbr@nrc.gov)

Mitzi A. Young, Esq.

Email: [may@nrc.gov](mailto:may@nrc.gov)

Marian L. Zobler, Esq.

Email: [mlz@nrc.gov](mailto:mlz@nrc.gov)

Andrea L. Silvia, Esq.

Email: [alc1@nrc.gov](mailto:alc1@nrc.gov)

David Roth, Esq.

Email: [der@nrc.gov](mailto:der@nrc.gov)

Margaret J. Bupp

Email: [mjb5@nrc.gov](mailto:mjb5@nrc.gov)

OGCMailCenter

Email: [OGCMailCenter@nrc.gov](mailto:OGCMailCenter@nrc.gov)

Hunton & Williams LLP

Counsel for the U.S. Department of Energy

Riverfront Plaza, East Tower

951 East Byrd Street

Richmond, VA 23219

W. Jeffery Edwards, Esq.

Email: [jedwards@hunton.com](mailto:jedwards@hunton.com)

Kelly L. Faglioni, Esq.

Email: [kfaglioni@hunton.com](mailto:kfaglioni@hunton.com)

Melissa Grier

Email: [mgrier@hunton.com](mailto:mgrier@hunton.com)

Donald P. Irwin, Esq.

Email: [dirwin@hunton.com](mailto:dirwin@hunton.com)

Stephanie Meharg

Email: [smeharg@hunton.com](mailto:smeharg@hunton.com)

Edward P. Noonan, Esq.

Email: [enoonan@hunton.com](mailto:enoonan@hunton.com)

Audrey B. Rusteau

Email: [arusteau@hunton.com](mailto:arusteau@hunton.com)

Michael R. Shebelskie, Esq.

Email: [mshebelskie@hunton.com](mailto:mshebelskie@hunton.com)

Pat Slayton

Email: [pslayton@hunton.com](mailto:pslayton@hunton.com)

Belinda A. Wright

Email: [bwright@hunton.com](mailto:bwright@hunton.com)

U.S. Department Of Energy

Office of General Counsel

1551 Hillshire Drive

Las Vegas, NV 89134-6321

George W. Hellstrom

Email: [george.hellstrom@ymp.gov](mailto:george.hellstrom@ymp.gov)

U.S. Department of Energy

Office of General Counsel

1000 Independence Avenue, S.W.

Washington, DC 20585

Martha S. Crosland, Esq.

Email: [martha.crosland@hq.doe.gov](mailto:martha.crosland@hq.doe.gov)

Angela M. Kordyak, Esq.

Email: [angela.kordyak@hq.doe.gov](mailto:angela.kordyak@hq.doe.gov)

Mary B. Neumayr, Esq.\*

Email: [mary.neumayr@hq.doe.gov](mailto:mary.neumayr@hq.doe.gov)

Carter Ledyard & Milburn, LLP

Counsel for Lincoln County

1401 Eye Street, N.W., Suite 300

Washington, DC 20005

Barry S. Neuman, Esq.

Email: [neuman@clm.com](mailto:neuman@clm.com)

U.S. Department of Energy

1000 Independence Avenue, S.W.

Washington, DC 20585

Eric Knox, Associate Director, Systems

Operations and External Relations, OCRWM\*

Email: [eric.knox@hq.doe.gov](mailto:eric.knox@hq.doe.gov)

Dong Kim, LSN Project Manager, OCRWM\*

Email: [dong.kim@rw.doe.gov](mailto:dong.kim@rw.doe.gov)

Churchill, Esmeralda, Eureka, Mineral  
and Lander Counties

1705 Wildcat Lane

Ogden, UT 84403

Loreen Pitchford, LSN Coordinator  
for Lander County

Email: [lpitchford@comcast.net](mailto:lpitchford@comcast.net)

U.S. Department of Energy

Office of Civilian Radioactive Waste Mgmt

Office of Repository Development

1551 Hillshire Drive

Las Vegas, NV 89134-6321

Timothy C. Gunter

Email: [timothy\\_gunter@ymp.gov](mailto:timothy_gunter@ymp.gov)

City of Las Vegas

400 Stewart Ave.

Las Vegas, NV 89101

Margaret Plaster, Management Analyst

Email: [mplaster@LasVegasNevada.gov](mailto:mplaster@LasVegasNevada.gov)

Clark County (NV) Nuclear Waste Division

500 S. Grand Central Parkway

Las Vegas, NV 89155

Irene Navis\*

Email: [iln@co.clark.nv.us](mailto:iln@co.clark.nv.us)

Engelbrecht von Tiesenhausen

Email: [evt@co.clark.nv.us](mailto:evt@co.clark.nv.us)



Nuclear Waste Project Office  
1761 East College Parkway, Suite 118  
Carson City, NV 89706  
Robert Loux  
Email: [bloux@nuc.state.nv.us](mailto:bloux@nuc.state.nv.us)  
Steve Frishman, Tech. Policy Coordinator  
Email: [steve.frishman@gmail.com](mailto:steve.frishman@gmail.com)

Eureka County and Lander County, Nevada  
Harmon, Curran, Speilberg & Eisenberg, LLP  
1726 M. Street N.W., Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20036  
Diane Curran, Esq.  
Email: [dcurran@harmoncurran.com](mailto:dcurran@harmoncurran.com)

Public Citizen  
215 Pennsylvania Ave, SE  
Washington, DC 20003  
Michele Boyd, Legislative Director  
Critical Mass Energy and Environment  
Email: [mboyd@citizen.org](mailto:mboyd@citizen.org)

Nevada Nuclear Waste Task Force  
P.O. Box 26177  
Las Vegas, NV 89126  
Judy Treichel, Executive Director  
Email: [judyntwf@aol.com](mailto:judyntwf@aol.com)

Talisman International, LLC  
1000 Potomac St., NW  
Suite 300  
Washington, D.C. 20007  
Patricia Larimore  
Email: [plarimore@talisman-intl.com](mailto:plarimore@talisman-intl.com)

Nuclear Energy Institute  
1776 I Street, NW, Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20006-3708  
Michael A. Bauser, Esq.  
Associate General Counsel  
Email: [mab@nei.org](mailto:mab@nei.org)  
Anne W. Cottingham, Esq.  
Email: [awc@nei.org](mailto:awc@nei.org)  
Ellen C. Ginsberg, Esq.  
Email: [ecg@nei.org](mailto:ecg@nei.org)  
Rod McCullum\*  
Email: [rxm@nei.org](mailto:rxm@nei.org)  
Steven P. Kraft\*  
Email: [spk@nei.org](mailto:spk@nei.org)

White Pine County  
City of Caliente  
Lincoln County  
P.O. Box 126  
Caliente, NV 89008  
Jason Pitts  
Email: [jayson@idtservices.com](mailto:jayson@idtservices.com)

Nuclear Information and Resource Service  
6930 Carroll Avenue, Suite 340  
Takoma Park, MD 20912  
Kevin Kamps  
Email: [kevin@nirs.org](mailto:kevin@nirs.org)

Yucca Mountain Project, Licensing Group,  
DOE/BSC  
Regulatory Programs  
1180 North Town Center Drive  
Las Vegas, NV 89144  
Jeffrey Kriner  
Email: [jeffrey\\_kriner@ymp.gov](mailto:jeffrey_kriner@ymp.gov)

Abigail Johnson\*  
612 West Telegraph Street  
Carson City, NV 89703  
Email: [abbyj@gbis.com](mailto:abbyj@gbis.com)

National Congress of American Indians  
1301 Connecticut Ave. NW - Second floor  
Washington, DC 20036  
Robert I. Holden, Director\*  
Nuclear Waste Program  
Email: [robert\\_holden@ncai.org](mailto:robert_holden@ncai.org)

Ross, Dixon & Bell  
2001 K Street N.W.  
Washington D.C. 20006-1040  
William H. Briggs\*  
Email: [wbriggs@rdbl原因.com](mailto:wbriggs@rdbl原因.com)  
Merril Hirsh, Esq.\*  
Email: [mhirsh@rdbl原因.com](mailto:mhirsh@rdbl原因.com)

Churchill County (NV)  
155 North Taylor Street, Suite 182  
Fallon, NV 89406  
Alan Kall\*  
Email: [comptroller@churchillcounty.org](mailto:comptroller@churchillcounty.org)

Inyo County Water Department  
Yucca Mtn Nuclear Waste  
Repository Assessment Office  
163 May St.  
Bishop, CA 93514  
Matt Gaffney, Project Associate\*  
Email: [mgaffney@inyoyucca.org](mailto:mgaffney@inyoyucca.org)

Environmental Protection Agency  
Ray Clark\*  
Email: [clark.ray@epa.gov](mailto:clark.ray@epa.gov)

Nuclear Waste Technical Review Board  
Joyce Dory\*  
Email: [dory@nwtrb.gov](mailto:dory@nwtrb.gov)

Intertech Services Corporation  
(for Lincoln County)  
P.O. Box 2008  
Carson City, NV 89702-2008  
Dr. Mike Baughman\*  
Email: [bigboff@aol.com](mailto:bigboff@aol.com)

Nye County (NV) Department of Natural  
Resources & Federal Facilities  
1210 E. Basin Road, Suite 6  
Pahrump, NV 89048  
David Swanson\*  
Email: [dswanson@nyecounty.net](mailto:dswanson@nyecounty.net)

Lincoln County (NV) Nuclear Oversight Prgm  
100 Depot Ave., Suite 15; P.O. Box 1068  
Caliente, NV 89008-1068  
Lea Rasura-Alfano, Coordinator\*  
Email: [jcciac@co.lincoln.nv.us](mailto:jcciac@co.lincoln.nv.us)

Nye County (NV) Regulatory/Licensing Adv.  
18160 Cottonwood Rd. #265  
Sunriver, OR 97707  
Malachy Murphy\*  
Email: [mrmurphy@cmc.net](mailto:mrmurphy@cmc.net)

Mineral County (NV) Board of County  
Commissioners  
P.O. Box 1600  
Hawthorne, NV 89415  
Linda Mathias, Administrator\*  
Office of Nuclear Projects  
Email: [yuccainfo@mineralcountynv.org](mailto:yuccainfo@mineralcountynv.org)

State of Nevada (NV)  
100 N. Carson Street  
Carson City, NV 89710  
Marta Adams\*  
Email: [maadams@ag.state.nv.us](mailto:maadams@ag.state.nv.us)

White Pine County (NV) Nuclear  
Waste Project Office  
959 Campton Street  
Ely, NV 89301  
Mike Simon, Director\*  
(Heidi Williams, Adm. Assist.\*)  
Email: [wpnucwst1@mwpower.net](mailto:wpnucwst1@mwpower.net)

Fredericks & Peebles, L.L.P.  
1001 Second Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
916-441-2700  
FAX 916-441-2067  
Darcie L. Houck  
Email: [dhouck@ndnlaw.com](mailto:dhouck@ndnlaw.com)  
John M. Peebles  
Email: [jpeebles@ndnlaw.com](mailto:jpeebles@ndnlaw.com)

/s/

Susan Montesi