

December 16, 2004

Mr. James F. Mallay  
Director, Regulatory Affairs  
Framatome ANP  
3815 Old Forest Road  
Lynchburg, VA 24501

SUBJECT: PALISADES NUCLEAR POWER PLANT - FRAMATOME ANP REQUEST FOR  
WITHHOLDING INFORMATION FROM PUBLIC DISCLOSURE  
(TAC NO. MC3931)

Dear Mr. Mallay:

By letter dated August 19, 2004, Nuclear Management Company, LLC submitted an affidavit dated August 19, 2004, executed by Gayle F. Elliott, requesting that the information contained in the following documents be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR) Part 2 Section 2.390:

1. Attachment 2 to Enclosure 1 - AREVA Document 32-5043862-00, "Palisades CRDM Nozzle IDTB Weld Anomaly Flaw Evaluations," dated July 2004
2. Attachment 3 to Enclosure 1 - AREVA Document 32-5045260-00, "Palisades ICI Nozzle IDTB Weld Anomaly Flaw Evaluations," dated July 2004
3. Attachment 1 to Enclosure 2 - AREVA Document 32-5044161-00, "Palisades CRDM Nozzle IDTB J-Groove Weld Flaw Evaluation," dated July 2004
4. Attachment 2 to Enclosure 2 - AREVA Document 32-5045743-00, "Palisades ICI Nozzle IDTB Weld Flaw Evaluation," dated July 2004

Nonproprietary copies of these documents have been placed in the U. S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's (NRC's) Public Document Room and added to the Agencywide Documents Access and Management System Public Electronic Reading Room.

The affidavit stated that the submitted information should be considered exempt from mandatory public disclosure for the following reasons:

- (a) The information reveals details of Framatome ANP's (FANP's) research and development plans and programs or their results.
- (b) Use of the information by a competitor would permit the competitor to significantly reduce its expenditures, in time or resources, to design, produce, or market a similar product or service.

- (c) The information includes test data or analytical techniques concerning a process, methodology, or component, the application of which results in a competitive advantage for FANP.
- (d) The information reveals certain distinguishing aspects of a process, methodology, or component, the exclusive use of which provides a competitive advantage for FANP in product optimization or marketability.
- (e) The information is vital to a competitive advantage held by FANP, would be helpful to competitors to FANP, and would likely cause substantial harm to the competitive position of FANP.

We have reviewed your application and the material in accordance with the requirements of 10 CFR 2.390 and, on the basis of your statements, have determined that the submitted information sought to be withheld contains proprietary commercial information and should be withheld from public disclosure.

Therefore, the versions of the submitted information marked as proprietary, will be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to 10 CFR 2.390(b)(5) and Section 103(b) of the Atomic Energy Act of 1954, as amended.

Withholding from public inspection shall not affect the right, if any, of persons properly and directly concerned to inspect the documents. If the need arises, we may send copies of this information to our consultants working in this area. We will, of course, ensure that the consultants have signed the appropriate agreements for handling proprietary information.

If the basis for withholding this information from public inspection should change in the future such that the information could then be made available for public inspection, you should promptly notify the NRC. You also should understand that the NRC may have cause to review this determination in the future, for example, if the scope of a Freedom of Information Act request includes your information. In all review situations, if the NRC makes a determination adverse to the above, you will be notified in advance of any public disclosure.

If you have any questions regarding this matter, I may be reached at 301-415-1439.

Sincerely,

/RA/

David H. Jaffe, Acting Project Manager, Section 1  
Project Directorate III  
Division of Licensing Project Management  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-255

cc: See next page

Palisades Plant

cc:

Robert A. Fenech, Senior Vice President  
Nuclear, Fossil, and Hydro Operations  
Consumers Energy Company  
1945 Parnall Rd.  
Jackson, MI 49201

Arunas T. Udry, Esquire  
Consumers Energy Company  
1 Energy Plaza  
Jackson, MI 49201

Regional Administrator, Region III  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
801 Warrenville Road  
Lisle, IL 60532-4351

Supervisor  
Covert Township  
P. O. Box 35  
Covert, MI 49043

Office of the Governor  
P. O. Box 30013  
Lansing, MI 48909

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Resident Inspector's Office  
Palisades Plant  
27782 Blue Star Memorial Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

Michigan Department of Environmental Quality  
Waste and Hazardous Materials Division  
Hazardous Waste and Radiological  
Protection Section  
Nuclear Facilities Unit  
Constitution Hall, Lower-Level North  
525 West Allegan Street  
P.O. Box 30241  
Lansing, MI 48909-7741

Michigan Department of Attorney General  
Special Litigation Division  
525 West Ottawa St.  
Sixth Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building  
Lansing, MI 48913

Manager, Regulatory Affairs  
Nuclear Management Company, LLC  
27780 Blue Star Memorial Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

Director of Nuclear Assets  
Consumers Energy Company  
Palisades Nuclear Plant  
27780 Blue Star Memorial Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

John Paul Cowan  
Executive Vice President & Chief Nuclear  
Officer  
Nuclear Management Company, LLC  
700 First Street  
Hudson, WI 54016

Jonathan Rogoff, Esquire  
Vice President, Counsel & Secretary  
Nuclear Management Company, LLC  
700 First Street  
Hudson, WI 54016

Douglas E. Cooper  
Senior Vice President - Group Operations  
Palisades Nuclear Plant  
Nuclear Management Company, LLC  
27780 Blue Star Memorial Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

Daniel J. Malone  
Site Vice President  
Palisades Nuclear Plant  
Nuclear Management Company, LLC  
27780 Blue Star Memorial Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

October 2003

- (c) The information includes test data or analytical techniques concerning a process, methodology, or component, the application of which results in a competitive advantage for FANP.
- (d) The information reveals certain distinguishing aspects of a process, methodology, or component, the exclusive use of which provides a competitive advantage for FANP in product optimization or marketability.
- (e) The information is vital to a competitive advantage held by FANP, would be helpful to competitors to FANP, and would likely cause substantial harm to the competitive position of FANP.

We have reviewed your application and the material in accordance with the requirements of 10 CFR 2.390 and, on the basis of your statements, have determined that the submitted information sought to be withheld contains proprietary commercial information and should be withheld from public disclosure.

Therefore, the versions of the submitted information marked as proprietary, will be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to 10 CFR 2.390(b)(5) and Section 103(b) of the Atomic Energy Act of 1954, as amended.

Withholding from public inspection shall not affect the right, if any, of persons properly and directly concerned to inspect the documents. If the need arises, we may send copies of this information to our consultants working in this area. We will, of course, ensure that the consultants have signed the appropriate agreements for handling proprietary information.

If the basis for withholding this information from public inspection should change in the future such that the information could then be made available for public inspection, you should promptly notify the NRC. You also should understand that the NRC may have cause to review this determination in the future, for example, if the scope of a Freedom of Information Act request includes your information. In all review situations, if the NRC makes a determination adverse to the above, you will be notified in advance of any public disclosure.

If you have any questions regarding this matter, I may be reached at 301-415-1439.

Sincerely,

/RA/

David H. Jaffe, Acting Project Manager, Section 1  
Project Directorate III  
Division of Licensing Project Management  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-255

cc: See next page

DISTRIBUTION

PUBLIC	DJaffe	EDuncan	TChan
PDIII-1 R/F	THarris	OGC	
LRaghavan	DDuvigneaud	WRuland	

ADAMS Accession No.: ML043380350

OFFICE	PDIII-1/PE	PDIII-1/ (A)PM	EMCB/SC	PDIII-1/LA	PDIII-1/SC
NAME	DDuvigneaud	DJaffe	TChan	THarris	LRaghavan
DATE	12/10/04	12/10/04	12/15/04	12/09/04	12/16/04

**OFFICIAL RECORD COPY**