

December 3, 2004

ORGANIZATION: EXELON GENERATION COMPANY, LLC

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF PUBLIC MEETING WITH EXELON GENERATION
COMPANY REGARDING THE SEISMIC ANALYSIS FOR THE CLINTON
EARLY SITE PERMIT (ESP) APPLICATION

The Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) held a public meeting with Exelon Generation Company, LLC (Exelon) on September 16, 2004, at the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) offices in Rockville, Maryland. The purpose of the meeting was to discuss Exelon's seismic analysis for their early site permit (ESP) application for the Clinton ESP site. For a list of meeting attendees refer to Enclosure 1. The meeting agenda is Enclosure 2.

Exelon staff stated that they requested the meeting to discuss topics related to the NRC staff's requests for additional information issued on July 26, 2004, concerning Exelon's seismic analysis for the Clinton ESP site found in Section 2.5 of Exelon's Site Safety Analysis Report.. Specifically, Exelon wanted to address its use of the American Society of Civil Engineer's (ASCE) performance-based method for determining the site safe shutdown earthquake (SSE), as outlined in draft Standard ASCE/SEI 43-05, "Seismic Design Criteria for Structures, Systems and Components in Nuclear Facilities and Commentary." The ASCE performance-based methodology has not been reviewed and approved by the NRC, but Exelon stated its belief that the methodology is in conformance with NRC regulations in 10 CFR Part 100. Exelon and the NRC staff discussed the regulations in 10 CFR 100.23(d)(1) that provide the requirements for the determination of the SSE ground motion. Exelon stated its belief that 10 CFR 100.23(d)(1) does not specify a particular methodology for determination of the SSE ground motion, but, rather, defines how it should be characterized or described.

Exelon further stated that the guidance contained in Regulatory Guide (RG) 1.60, "Design Response Spectra for Seismic Design of Nuclear Power Plants," was based on designs of nuclear power plants already in operation and therefore incorporated equipment performance, albeit in a different manner than it is being incorporated in the ASCE methodology. The incorporation of equipment performance in the ASCE method is one of the issues that concerned the NRC staff. Exelon also noted that the determination of the reference probability in RG 1.60 was based on 29 existing nuclear power plant sites being safe based on their individual SSEs and equipment performance at those plants. This reference probability was then used in RG 1.165, Identification and Characterization of Seismic Sources and Determination of Safe Shutdown Earthquake Ground Motion," which outlines the NRC's approved method for determination of the site SSE.

Exelon stated its belief that the ASCE approach gives a more consistent level of risk across the different sites. The NRC staff responded that it believes having a consistent hazard across different sites is important, and that the ASCE method does not provide a consistent hazard across sites. The NRC staff further stated that it believed the goal of an ESP was simply to characterize the site and not to include any information about the plant design in that characterization.

Exelon reiterated its belief that it has met 10 CFR 100.23 with the use of the ASCE method. The NRC staff responded that, even if the staff determined that the new method did not meet 10 CFR 100.23, Exelon could still pursue the use of the ASCE method through a request for an exemption to 10 CFR 100.23. The staff pointed out that the major issue with Exelon's use of the ASCE method is its affect on the NRC review schedule for Exelon's ESP application. Exelon stated that it understood the scheduler implications of seeking approval of its use of the ASCE method.

Exelon and the NRC staff discussed the changes to 10 CFR Part 100 from a historical perspective, including a discussion of the Commission papers and statements of consideration associated with the 10 CFR Part 100 rule change in the 1990s. Differing views were expressed as to whether it was the NRC staff's intent to separate the determination of the SSE from design considerations. The NRC staff indicated that it was in the process of revising RG 1.60 to conform to the revised Part 100 but that completion of that effort was quite a way off.

Exelon asked the staff what it needed to go forward with its review of the ASCE approach. The staff responded that it needed to see the derivation of the approach, including the assumptions used, and that the information in the draft ASCE Standard and the associated commentary was not enough for the staff to reach a conclusion regarding the methodology. The staff stated that it needed a comprehensive, integrated, exhaustive, and coherent document describing the ASCE approach from Exelon. The staff stated that, once it had such a document, it could develop a schedule for review of Exelon's use of the ASCE approach. Exelon agreed to provide the staff with such a document.

On another topic, Exelon stated that it noted that the staff did not request any additional information regarding its seismic analysis for high frequency ground motions. Exelon was concerned because the results for the Clinton site in this range were not bounded by the RG 1.60 response spectrum. The staff indicated that this topic was not relevant to the ESP review because the staff was only looking at defining the SSE for the ESP site. Exelon stated that it was hoping to receive a finding that the Clinton ESP site was suitable for any design that was certified to RG 1.60 standards. The staff stated that it did not intend to make such a finding for ESPs. Exelon pointed out that this appeared inconsistent with the staff's earlier plans as noted in the NRC's June 17, 2003, letter to the Nuclear Energy Institute (NEI) on Resolution of Early Site Permit Topic 13 (ESP-13), Guidance for ESP Seismic Evaluations. The staff agreed to review the letter and provide Exelon with any additional feedback on the issue resulting from its review of the letter.

Finally, the NRC staff inquired about the status of the NEI Seismic Task Force. Exelon stated that the Task Force is up and running but that NEI is allowing the ESP applicants to take the lead on seismic issues with NEI providing support.

/RA/

Nanette V. Gilles, Senior Project Manager
New Reactors Section
New, Research and Test Reactors Program
Division of Regulatory Improvement Programs
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 52-007

Enclosures: As stated

cc w/encl: See next page

Finally, the NRC staff inquired about the status of the NEI Seismic Task Force. Exelon stated that the Task Force is up and running but that NEI is allowing the ESP applicants to take the lead on seismic issues with NEI providing support.

/RA/

Nanette V. Gilles, Senior Project Manager
New Reactors Section
New, Research and Test Reactors Program
Division of Regulatory Improvement Programs
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 52-007

Enclosures: As stated

cc w/encl: See next page

ADAMS ACCESSION NUMBERS: ML0-Meeting Summary, Agenda (Enclosure 1) and
Meeting Attendees (Enclosure 2)

OFFICE	PM:RNRP:NRR	SC:EMEB:NRR	SC:RNRP:NRR
NAME	NGilles	KManoly	LDudes
DATE	11/22/2004	11/29/2004	12/02/2004

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

Distribution for Meeting Summary dated December 3, 2004

Hard Copy

RNRP R/F

WBeckner

NGilles

LDudes

KManoly

CMunson

E-Mail

PUBLIC

JDyer/RBorchardt (RidsNrrOd)

BSheron (RidsNrrAdpt)

RBarrett

GImbro

KManoly

CMunson

DMatthews

NGilles

RAnand

MScott, RNRP

JWilson, RNRP

TKenyon

AHodgdon, OGC

MLemoncelli, OGC

RGardner, RIII

MEI-Zeftawy, ACRS

KWinsberg, OGC

**MEETING AGENDA: SEPTEMBER 16, 2004
U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION (NRC)
MEETING WITH EXELON GENERATING COMPANY, LLC (EXELON)
ON SEISMIC ANALYSES CONTAINED IN EXELON'S SITE SAFETY ANALYSIS REPORT
SUBMITTED AS PART OF ITS APPLICATION FOR AN EARLY SITE PERMIT (ESP)
FOR THE CLINTON SITE**

9:00 a.m.	Introductory Comments	NRC/Exelon
9:15 a.m.	Discussion of Exelon's seismic analyses in support of its ESP application	NRC/Exelon
11:30 a.m.	Summary	NRC/Exelon
11:45 a.m.	Public Comment	
12:00 noon	Adjourn	

Meeting With
Exelon Generation Company, LLC
September 16, 2004
Attendance List

<u>Name</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>
Thomas P. Mundy	Exelon
Eddie Grant	Exelon
George Zinke	Entergy
Carl Stepp	EHS/Entergy
Robert Kennedy	RPK Struct. Mechanics
Allin Cornell	CAC Co. Consultant
Donald Anderson	CH2M HILL
Robert Youngs	Geomatrix Consultants
Jolene Seitz	Department of Energy
Steve Routh	Bechtel
Bill Smith	Energetics
Laura Dudes, NRR	NRC/NRR/DRIP
Nanette Gilles, NRR	NRC/NRR/DRIP
Gene Imbro	NRC/NRR/DE
William Beckner	NRC/NRR/DRIP
Michael Scott	NRC/NRR/DRIP
Raj Anand	NRC/NRR/DRIP
Goutam Bagchi	NRC/NRR/DE
Cliff Munson	NRC/NRR/DE
Yong Li	NRC/NRR/DE
Mauri Lemoncelli	NRC/OGC
Ann Hodgdon	NRC/OGC
Kamal Manoly	NRC/NRR/DE

Exelon ESP

cc:

Mr. David Lochbaum
Union of Concerned Scientists
1707 H Street, NW
Suite 600
Washington, DC 20006-3919

Mr. Paul Gunter
Director of the Reactor Watchdog Project
Nuclear Information & Resource Service
1424 16th Street, NW, Suite 404
Washington, DC 20036

Mr. Adrian Heymer
Nuclear Energy Institute
Suite 400
1776 I Street, NW
Washington, DC 20006-3708

Mr. Russell Bell
Nuclear Energy Institute
Suite 400
1776 I Street, NW
Washington, DC 20006-3708

Mr. Thomas P. Miller
U.S. Department of Energy
Headquarters - Germantown
19901 Germantown Road
Germantown, MD 20874-1290

Mr. James Riccio
Greenpeace
702 H Street, NW, Suite 300
Washington, DC 20001

Mr. Rod Krich
Vice President, Licensing Projects
Exelon Nuclear
4300 Winfield Road
Warrenville, IL 60555

Ms. Patricia Campbell
Winston & Strawn
1400 L Street, NW
Washington, DC 20005

Mr. Ernie H. Kennedy
Vice President New Plants
Nuclear Plant Projects
Westinghouse Electric Company
2000 Day Hill Road
Windsor, CT 06095-0500

Dr. Regis A. Matzie
Senior Vice President and
Chief Technology Officer
Westinghouse Electric Company
2000 Day Hill Road
Windsor, CT 06095-0500

Ms. Marilyn Kray
Vice President, Project Development
Exelon Generation
200 Exelon Way, KSA3-N
Kennett Square, PA 19348

Mr. Thomas Mundy
Director, Project Development
Exelon Generation
200 Exelon Way, KSA3-N
Kennett Square, PA 19348

Mr. William Maher
Exelon Generation
200 Exelon Way, KSA2-N
Kennett Square, PA 19348

Mr. Thomas S. O'Neill
Associate General Counsel
Exelon Nuclear
4300 Winfield Road
Warrenville, IL 60555

Exelon Nuclear
Correspondence Control Desk
200 Exelon Way, KSA1-N
Kennett Square PA, 19348

Mr. John Loaniddi
Parsons Energy and Chemicals
2675 Morgantown Road
Reading, PA 19607

Ms. Amy Lientz
CH2MHILL
151 N. Ridge Ave. Ste 150
Idaho Falls, Idaho 83402-4039

Mr. Steven P. Frantz Esq.
Morgan Lewis and Bockius LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20004

Mr. Gary Wright, Director
Division of Nuclear Safety
Illinois Emergency Management Agency
1035 Outer Park Drive
Springfield, IL 62704

Mr. Paul Leventhal
Nuclear Control Institute
1000 Connecticut Avenue, NW
Suite 410
Washington, DC 20036

Dr. Jack W. Roe
Vice President
Advanced Technologies & Laboratories
International, Inc.
20010 Century Boulevard, Suite 500
Germantown, MD 20874

Mr. Tom Clements
6703 Guide Avenue
Takoma Park, MD 20912

Mr. Glenn H. Archinoff
5275 Westview Drive
ACR Suite
Frederick, MD. 21703-8306

Mr. Brendan Hoffman
Research Associate on Nuclear Energy
Public Citizens Critical Mass Energy
and Environmental Program
215 Pennsylvania Avenue, SE
Washington, DC 20003

Prairie Group
Attn: Mr. George Gore
702 West Washington Street
Urbana, IL 61801

Mr. Arthur L. Brighton
RR1, Box 22
Weldon, IL 61882

Mr. Dale Holtzscher
RR 1, Box 72A
Weldon, IL 61882

Mr. John Stolfa
P.O. Box 589
Mansfield, IL 61854-0589

Mr. Ed Wallace, General Manager
Projects
PBMR Pty LTD
PO Box 9396
Centurion 0046
Republic of South Africa

Ms. Vanessa E. Quinn, Chief
Radiological Emergency Preparedness
Section
Department of Homeland Security/FEMA
500 C Street, SW
Washington, DC 20472

Mr. Joseph D. Hegner
Lead Engineer - Licensing
Dominion Generation
Early Site Permitting Project
5000 Dominion Boulevard
Glen Allen, VA 23060

Mr. George Alan Zinke
Project Manager
Nuclear Business Development
Entergy Nuclear
M-ECH-683
1340 Echelon Parkway
Jackson, MS 39213

Mr. Charles Brinkman
Westinghouse Electric Co.
Washington Operations
12300 Twinbrook Pkwy., Suite 330
Rockville, MD 20852

Mr. Marvin Fertel
Senior Vice President
and Chief Nuclear Officer
Nuclear Energy Institute
Suite 400
1776 I Street, NW
Washington, DC 20006-3708

Dr. Glenn R. George
PA Consulting Group
130 Potter Street
Haddonfield, NJ 08033

Mr. Arthur R. Woods
Enercon Services, Inc.
500 TownPark Lane
Kennesaw, GA 30144

Mr. Tom Rudasill
The Vespasian Warner Public Library
District
310 N. Quincy Street
Clinton, IL 61727

External E-mail
eddie.grant@exeloncorp.com
jim.mallay@framatome-anp.com