

RAS 7839

STATE OF UTAH
OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

DOCKETED
USNRC

May 26, 2004 (3:57PM)

OFFICE OF SECRETARY
RULEMAKINGS AND
ADJUDICATIONS STAFF



MARK L. SHURTLEFF
ATTORNEY GENERAL

RAY HINTZE
Chief Deputy - Civil

May 21, 2004

KIRK TORGENSEN
Chief Deputy - Criminal

Michael C. Farrar, Esq., Chairman
Dr. Peter S. Lam
Dr. Paul B. Abramson, Esq.
Administrative Judges
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555

Re: Private Fuel Storage, LLC, Docket 72-22-ISFSI

Dear Administrative Judges;

On September 18, 2003 the State served upon the Licensing Board and counsel for PFS and the NRC Staff the State of Utah's expert reports for the Utah K consequences proceeding. Among these reports was H. L. Horstman, *Evaluation of Impact Velocity and Impact Angle for F-16 Crashes at the Proposed PFS Site* (September 2003).

The State has recently identified an inadvertent error in this report which it wishes to correct at this time. In Attachment 4, the mishap report of 4 February 1997 shows an impact angle of 35° and it was incorrectly entered as 10°. A new Attachment 4 has been prepared. The correction also results in striking the last sentence in the first full paragraph on page 8 of the report. Enclosed are replacement page 8 and replacement Attachment 4 to this report. The enclosed pages should replace the corresponding pages in your copies of this report.

The report was originally filed as a safeguards document; however, the NRC Staff has since determined that it contains no safeguards information. See Sherwin Turk's November 17, 2003 letter to Licensing Board. Therefore, any reference to these pages potentially containing safeguards information has been removed from these replacement pages.

Sincerely,

James R. Soper
Assistant Attorney General

Attachments: as stated
cc: PFS service list

Template=SECY-043

SECY-02

impact speeds ranging from 179 to 428 KTAS. The simple averages for impact angle and speed are 10.78 degrees and 262.75 KTAS respectively.

The mishap of 16 December 91 is unusual in that the ejection is at 11,000 feet AGL,²¹ higher than the peak of a zoom for an engine failure in Sevier B MOA, where approximately 95% of the flights over the PFS site occur.

2. **Category Two crashes.** This category of PFS crashes will result from an in-flight emergency where the F-16 will impact without input from the pilot to reduce speed while attempting an airstart. In such an emergency the aircraft is uncontrollable and the pilot ejects without delay, or the pilot is disabled by the emergency event. Seven reports show Category Two crashes, none of which give an impact speed, and only two give specific impact angles.²² Because this category does not involve a common emergency procedure (such as an airstart during a shallow descent) or other flight pattern common to crashes in this Category, there is no expected grouping of impact parameters. The lack of data and the wide range of impact scenarios that fit this category permits only general observations useful in making bounding assumptions.

²¹ *PFS Speed & Angle Evaluation*, Tab G.

²² The report mishap dates are: 25-May-90, 13-Jan-91, 15-Jan-91, 19-Mar-91, 4-Apr-91, 19-Feb-93 and 16-Sep-97, and are designated by an (*) in the table in this report at Att. 3.

CATEGORY ONE DOCUMENTED SPEED AND ANGLE

Date	Impact Speed KTAS	Impact Angle Degrees
16-Dec-91	428	24
11-Aug-93	200	10
2-Feb-94	226	6
20-Sep-94	204	4.2
5-Feb-95	314	7
4-Feb-97	343	35
21-Apr-97	179	10
8-Jan-98	208	15

