

September 10, 2003

MEMORANDUM TO: William D. Travers  
Executive Director for Operations

FROM: Charles E. Ader, Chairman **/RA/**  
Committee to Review Generic Requirements

SUBJECT: MINUTES OF THE COMMITTEE TO REVIEW GENERIC  
REQUIREMENTS MEETING NUMBER 388

The Committee to Review Generic Requirements (CRGR) held special Meeting No. 388 on August 19, 2003, from 1:00 P.M. to 3:00 P.M., with the attendees listed in Attachment 1. The purpose of this meeting was to review the proposed Regulatory Guide 1.53, Rev. 1, "Application for Single-Failure Criterion to Safety Systems." ADAMS Accession No. ML032120089. The slide presentation is located in ADAMS, Accession No. ML032340260.

Mr. Satish Aggarwal, Office of Nuclear Regulatory Research, briefed the CRGR on the proposed Regulatory Guide 1.53, Rev. 1, "Application for Single-Failure Criterion to Safety Systems."

Following discussion of the proposed package, the CRGR recommended and the staff agreed that certain revisions were needed to be consistent with the staff's and CRGR's view that the Regulatory Guide is not imposing backfits.

The following are the key concerns that the CRGR discussed with the staff:

The CRGR found that the Regulatory Guide did not make it clear that the application of the guide will be consistent with the language in 10 CFR Part 50.55a (h) (i.e., regarding applicability to protection systems) for currently operating reactor licensees. The CRGR also recommended and the staff agreed that the word, "must" on page 2, in the second paragraph in the Discussion section, should be put in context with the use of the IEEE standard. The staff agreed to address these issues by including text that will resolve the above CRGR concerns.

Furthermore, the CRGR had a concern with the text in the Implementation section regarding the use of the new IEEE criteria for currently operating reactor licensees. CRGR was concerned that this may introduce a backfit of their licensing basis in that it will not allow licensees to use the previous criteria or alternative for portions of the system where still applicable. The staff agreed to modify the text to address this concern.

The CRGR and the staff agreed that staff would provide revised documents to the CRGR members to verify that the modifications have adequately addressed the CRGR concerns.

Subsequent to the CRGR review, the staff has provided a revised version of the regulatory guide that addresses the CRGR recommendations and concerns (ADAMS No. ML032521407).

Attachment: As stated

cc: See attached list.

C:\ORPCheckout\FileNET\ML032540804.wpd

OAR in ADAMS? (Y or N) Y ADAMS ACCESSION NO.: ML032540804 TEMPLATE NO. CRGR-001  
Publicly Available? (Y or N) Y DATE OF RELEASE TO PUBLIC N/A SENSITIVE? N

To receive a copy of this document, indicate in the box: "C" = Copy without attachment/enclosure "E" = Copy with attachment/enclosure  
"N" = No copy

OFFICE	CRGR		CRGR					
NAME	L. Cupidon		C. Ader					
DATE	9/09/03		9/10/03					

(RES File Code) RES \_\_\_\_\_

**CRGR MEETING No. 388**  
**LIST OF ATTENDEES**  
**(August 19, 2003)**

**CRGR Members**

Charles E. Ader, Chairman  
John W. Craig, NRR (for Brian W. Sheron, NRR)  
M. Wayne Hodges, NMSS (for Margaret V. Federline, NMSS)  
Janice E. Moore, OGC  
Jack R. Strosnider, RES (other task)  
Bruce S. Mallett, RII

Les Cupidon, CRGR Staff

**RES Staff**

Satish K. Aggarwal, RES/DET/MEB  
Subinoy Mazumdar, RES/DET/ERAB  
Jitendra P. Vora, RES/DET/MEB  
Michael Mayfied, RES/DET

MEMO DATED: 9/10/03

SUBJECT: MINUTES FOR THE COMMITTEE TO REVIEW GENERIC REQUIREMENTS  
MEETING NUMBER 386

cc w/atts:

Chairman Diaz

Commissioner McGaffigan

Commissioner Merrifield

Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary of the Commission

William D. Travers, EDO

William F. Kane, DEDR

Carl J. Paperiello, DEDMRS

Samuel J. Collins, DEDR

Frank J. Congel, OE

Hubert T. Bell, OIG

Karen D. Cyr, OGC

John T. Larkins, ACRS

Martin J. Virgilio, NMSS

R. William Borchardt, NRR

Roy Zimmerman, NSIR

Ashok C. Thadani, RES

W. Beecher, OPA

H. Miller, Region I

L. Reyes, Region II

Bruce Mallett, R II

J. Dyer, Region III

Thomas P. Gwynn, Region IV

Michael Mayfield, RES

Nilesh, Chokshi, RES

Jitendra, Vora, RES

Satish K. Aggarwal, RES

Subinoy Mazumdar, RES

Mail Stop

O-16 C1

O-16 C1

O-16 C1