

September 8, 2003

FACILITY: N. A.

LICENSEE: N. A.

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF MEETING HELD ON AUGUST 13, 2003, WITH MEMBERS OF THE INSTRUMENTATION AND AUTOMATION SOCIETY (ISA) 67.04 COMMITTEE REGARDING METHODS FOR DETERMINING ALLOWABLE VALUES FOR SAFETY-RELATED INSTRUMENTATION (TAC NO. MB4306)

On August 13, 2003, NRC staff met with members of ISA 67.04 Committee and other industry groups in Rockville, Maryland to discuss instrument setpoint methodology recommended in ISA S67.04 standard and used by licensees for determining protection system instrumentation setpoints. Part II of the standard, not endorsed by the staff, includes three methods for calculating allowable values which represents the limiting safety system settings (LSSS), as required by 10CFR50.36. Methods 1 and 2 determine values that are sufficiently conservative and acceptable to the staff. Method 3, however, used by some licensee does not appear to provide an acceptable degree of conservatism and it is of concern to the staff. ISA and the industry group believe that instrument channel operational testing and plant procedures provide assurance that trip setpoints will be maintained at appropriate levels. Furthermore, ISA maintains that the LSSS is represented by the trip setpoint and protect the analytical limit. The staff maintains that allowable values represent the LSSS and should be used for determining instrument operability as defined in the Standard Technical Specification. No resolution was reached during the meeting. The NRC staff also requested ISA to provide cost estimate information to change from method 3 to method 1 or 2 for calculating allowable value. Following the meeting ISA indicated that the cost estimate based on the information provided by several representative plant site ranges from \$5000,000 to \$1,000,000 per plant site. A list of the attendees is given in enclosure 1, and the copy of the handout provided by the ISA and by the NRC staff is given in enclosure 2 (ADAMS Accession No. MI032300040).

Hukam C. Garg, Sr Electrical Engineer  
Electrical & Instrumentation and Control Branch  
Division of Engineering  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Enclosures: As stated

September 8, 2003

FACILITY: N. A.

LICENSEE: N. A.

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF MEETING HELD ON AUGUST 13, 2003, WITH MEMBERS OF THE INSTRUMENTATION AND AUTOMATION SOCIETY (ISA) 67.04 COMMITTEE REGARDING METHODS FOR DETERMINING ALLOWABLE VALUES FOR SAFETY-RELATED INSTRUMENTATION (TAC NO. MB4306)

On August 13, 2003, NRC staff met with members of ISA 67.04 Committee and other industry groups in Rockville, Maryland to discuss instrument setpoint methodology recommended in ISA S67.04 standard and used by licensees for determining protection system instrumentation setpoints. Part II of the standard, not endorsed by the staff, includes three methods for calculating allowable values which represents the limiting safety system settings (LSSS), as required by 10CFR50.36. Methods 1 and 2 determine values that are sufficiently conservative and acceptable to the staff. Method 3, however, used by some licensee does not appear to provide an acceptable degree of conservatism and it is of concern to the staff. ISA and the industry group believe that instrument channel operational testing and plant procedures provide assurance that trip setpoints will be maintained at appropriate levels. Furthermore, ISA maintains that the LSSS is represented by the trip setpoint and protect the analytical limit. The staff maintains that allowable values represent the LSSS and should be used for determining instrument operability as defined in the Standard Technical Specification. No resolution was reached during the meeting. The NRC staff also requested ISA to provide cost estimate information to change from method 3 to method 1 or 2 for calculating allowable value. Following the meeting ISA indicated that the cost estimate based on the information provided by several representative plant site ranges from \$5000,000 to \$1,000,000 per plant site. A list of the attendees is given in enclosure 1, and the copy of the handout provided by the ISA and by the NRC staff is given in enclosure 2 (ADAMS Accession No. MI032300040).

Hukam C. Garg, Sr Electrical Engineer  
Electrical & Instrumentation and Control Branch  
Division of Engineering  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Enclosures: As stated

DISTRIBUTION:

JACalvo	ECMarinos	EEIB R/F	HCGarg	PRebstock	RClark
CSchulten	OGC	ACRS/ACNW	TBergman	TMarsh	

**ADAMS/ACCESSION No.: ML032410403**

OFFICE	EEIB:DE:NRR	SC:EEIB:NRR
NAME	HCGarg	ECMarinos
DATE	09/08/03	09/08/03

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

**MEETING BETWEEN NRC AND**

**ISA 67.04 COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

**APPLICABILITY OF METHODS 1, 2, & 3 TO DETERMINE ALLOWABLE VALUES**

**ATTENDANCE LIST**

**AUGUST 13, 2003**

**NRC**

E. Marinos, NRR  
W. Beckner, NRR  
R. Clark  
H. Garg  
T. Boyce  
D. Lurie  
C. Schulten  
C. Douth

**ISA COMMITTEE**

J. Voss  
R. Jarrett  
E. Quinn  
J. Guider  
R. Tuley  
J. Snelson  
M. Edison  
R. Fredricksen

**OTHER/PUBLIC**

M. Schoppman  
D. Woodland  
M. Flaherty  
D. Hoffman  
J. Mauck