

From: John Grobe *R-III*
To: *nm* Bruce Boger; Charles Casto; Edwin Hackett; Gary Holahan; John Zwolinski; Michael Mayfield
Date: 7/31/02 2:38PM
Subject: Re: Fwd: Industry Conference Presentation on Davis-Besse

Ed,

Thanks. Excellent comments. Regarding the repair slide, I was very briefly going to comment on the complexities of the analysis ten seconds maximum. The licensee is presenting the replacement story (I'm not sure why since this session is focussed on engineering analyses??) so I wanted to very briefly share the repair side and briefly touch on the complexities. Regarding slide 15, you hit the mark. The discussion again was going to focus not on conclusions, but on complexities, uncertainties and limitations of the analysis. We may get into a dialogue through Q & A in this area and I need to be careful to keep the discussion focused not on policy or decisionmaking, but on exploring the different facets of the question. I will change the title on slide 16. good comment.

Thanks.

Jack

>>> Edwin Hackett 07/31/02 12:52PM >>> *RES*

Jack/Mark,

Thanks for the opportunity to comment. I'd like to offer up a few suggestions:

- ED*
- (1) Slide 8 - Repair - I'm not sure what you were planning to say here, but I was wondering about the relevance given the path they have since chosen;
 - (2) Slide 15 - I think the content here is fine. However, it does raise the obvious broader (philosophical) issues that we have been questioned on by Dave Lochbaum and others:
 - clad not pressure boundary;
 - ASME Code gives no structural credit for cladding;
 - Although given the above, clad boundary prevented LOCA and potential radiological relief - how to "credit" this appropriately given the context;
 - How far do we continue to pursue this? I would argue that at some point, particularly regarding the progression time for the wastage and variables associated with predicting cladding rupture, the problem is either intractable or has too much uncertainty associated with it to be of much use;
 - (3) Slide 16 Title - "Lessons Learned." I would suggest changing the title to preliminary conclusions or summary so as not to get confused with the formal NRC LLTF activity;
 - (4) Slide 1 (edit) - Office of Nuclear REGULATORY Research

Take Care,

Ed

✓ John Grobe 07/31/02 09:15AM >>>
Bruce/Chuck/Gary/John/Mike,

R-III

V-9

Enclosed is a power point presentation that Mark Kirk and I intend to give during the industry conference at Amelia Island on August 13th. The focus of the 3 hour panel discussion is engineering analyses related to NSSS aging and degradation. In addition to Mark and me, the Panel will include Bruce Bevilacqua (Westinghouse), Alex Marion (NEI), and Pat McCloskey (FENOC). Be patient when you open the slides enclosure, it takes about 15 seconds to download the file.

I will be discussing Slides 1 - 10 focusing on the degradation at Davis-Besse, Mark will discuss Slides 11 - 14 regarding the probabilistic fracture mechanics analyses that we are working on, and then I will finish with Slides 15 and 16 regarding where we are headed and some lessons learned

Mark has done an exceptional job working with Mel Holmberg of my staff putting this presentation together. All of the materials except the last two slides have been used publically in the past in various meetings or are non-controversial, e.g., photographs.

Please focus particularly on the second last slide to ensure that you are comfortable with what I am saying there. I tried to ensure that the slide presents no conclusions regarding the risk assessment since we are not yet complete, while providing a clear focus on the types of analyses we have been working on and the additional analyses we may think are needed. The last slide is simply an opportunity for me to share some of my insights into the Davis-Besse situation.

I want to get this package to Donna Skay this week to ensure that she can get it into the conference organizers. Please review it if you have the time and call/e-mail with any comments or questions.

Thanks.

Jack

CC: Brian Sheron; Cynthia Carpenter; DB0350; Donna Skay; Doug Coe; James Caldwell; Jim Dyer; Mark Kirk; Michael Johnson; Niles Chokshi; Richard Barrett; Richard Borchardt; Stacey Rosenberg; Steven Long; Suzanne Black; Tad Marsh; William Kane