

March 20, 2001

MEMORANDUM TO: Stuart A. Richards, Director  
Project Directorate IV & Decommissioning  
Division of Licensing Project Management  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

FROM: David H. Jaffe, Senior Project Manager, Section 1 */RA/*  
Project Directorate IV & Decommissioning  
Division of Licensing Project Management  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF MEETING HELD ON FEBRUARY 28, 2001, WITH  
REPRESENTATIVES OF TXU ELECTRIC AND WESTINGHOUSE  
ELECTRIC COMPANY CONCERNING LASER WELDED SLEEVING OF  
STEAM GENERATOR TUBES

On February 28, 2001, Mr. D. Jaffe, and Mr. W. Lyon, of the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff, met with Mr. B. Mays and Mr. S. Swilley of TXU Electric (TXU or the licensee) and Mr. W. Cullen of Westinghouse Electric Company (Westinghouse). The purpose of the meeting was to discuss the NRC staff's review of the Westinghouse reports that had been submitted in support of the laser welded sleeving of the Comanche Peak Steam Electric Station (CPSES), Unit 1, steam generators (SGs).

Following review of the February 20, 2001, NRC staff Safety Evaluation concerning CPSES, Unit 1, laser welded sleeving, TXU pointed out that the characterization of the "plus point probe" was incorrect; the "plus point probe" is an eddy current test device rather than an ultrasonic test device. The NRC staff indicated agreement with the licensee's observation. Mr. Cullen described Westinghouse's experience with SG laser welded sleeving. Mr. Cullen indicated that loss of heat transfer due to laser welded sleeving was a minor affect. He also said that the hydraulic equivalency of laser welded sleeves relative to plugs, as calculated by the SLEEVE Code, was shown by testing conservatively. There was some discussion of the test data. The meeting participants also discussed potential use of plant data, such as those resulting from Maine Yankee Atomic Power Company's laser welded sleeving of all SG tubes, to help assess calculation accuracy. The technical discussion concluded following a brief interchange regarding whether accidents and transients might be affected by laser welded sleeves.

The NRC staff indicated that additional information would be needed for the NRC staff to complete its evaluation of the Westinghouse laser welded sleeving reports. The following was deemed by the NRC staff to be useful to complete its review:

1. A summary of the laser welded sleeve test report which might be provided in proprietary and nonproprietary forms.
2. An opportunity for the NRC staff to review calculation TH-97-08, "Sleeve Code Multiplier for Excess Conservatism." Westinghouse will consider making this calculation available for NRC staff review in its Rockville, Maryland office.

3. Documentation concerning the SLEEVE Code.
4. Laser welded sleeve/flow data from other plants.
5. Insights on the affects of laser welded sleeving on accidents and transients. If determined to be needed, this information will be requested via specific questions from the NRC staff.

Following the discussion of the NRC staff's information needs, the meeting was adjourned.

Docket Nos.: 50-445 and 50-446

Enclosures: As stated

cc w/encls: See next page

3. Documentation concerning the SLEEVE Code.
4. Laser welded sleeve/flow data from other plants.
5. Insights on the affects of laser welded sleeving on accidents and transients. If determined to be needed, this information will be requested via specific questions from the NRC staff.

Following the discussion of the NRC staff's information needs, the meeting was adjourned.

Docket Nos.: 50-445 and 50-446

Enclosures: As stated

cc w/encls: See next page

DISTRIBUTION:

PUBLIC

PDIV-1 RF

RidsNrrPMDJaffe

RidsOgcRp

RidsAcrsAcnwMailCenter

RidsNrrDlpm (JZwolinski/SBlack)

RidsNrrDlpmLpdiv (Srichards)

RidsNrrDlpmLpdiv1 (RGramm)

RidsNrrLADJohnson

RidsRgn4MailCenter

SMorris, EDO

Wlyon

Accession No.: ML010800120

OFFICE	PDIV-1/PM	PDIV-1/LA	PDIV-1/SC
NAME	DJaffe	DJohnson	RGramm
DATE	3/20/01	3/19/01	3/20/01

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

Comanche Peak Steam Electric Station

cc:

Senior Resident Inspector  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
P. O. Box 2159  
Glen Rose, TX 76403-2159

Regional Administrator, Region IV  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
611 Ryan Plaza Drive, Suite 400  
Arlington, TX 76011

Mrs. Juanita Ellis, President  
Citizens Association for Sound Energy  
1426 South Polk  
Dallas, TX 75224

Mr. Roger D. Walker  
Regulatory Affairs Manager  
TXU Electric  
P. O. Box 1002  
Glen Rose, TX 76043

George L. Edgar, Esq.  
Morgan, Lewis & Bockius  
1800 M Street, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20036-5869

Honorable Dale McPherson  
County Judge  
P. O. Box 851  
Glen Rose, TX 76043

Office of the Governor  
ATTN: John Howard, Director  
Environmental and Natural  
Resources Policy  
P. O. Box 12428  
Austin, TX 78711

Arthur C. Tate, Director  
Division of Compliance & Inspection  
Bureau of Radiation Control  
Texas Department of Health  
1100 West 49th Street  
Austin, TX 78756-3189

Jim Calloway  
Public Utility Commission of Texas  
Electric Industry Analysis  
P. O. Box 13326  
Austin, TX 78711-3326

Mr. C. Lance Terry  
Senior Vice President  
& Principal Nuclear Officer  
TU Electric  
ATTN: Regulatory Affairs Department  
P. O. Box 1002  
Glen Rose, TX 76043